Emergence of CO₂ electrolyzers including supported molecular catalysts

Kristian Torbensen¹, Benjamin Boudy¹, Dorian Joulié,^{1,2} Niklas von Wolff¹ and Marc Robert*,^{1,3}

¹Université de Paris, Laboratoire d'Electrochimie Moléculaire, CNRS, F-75013 Paris, France.

²Department of Chemistry, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, British Columbia V6T 1Z1, Canada. ³ Institut Universitaire de France (IUF), F-75005 Paris, France.

* robert@u-paris.fr

Abstract

With access to cheap, sustainable electricity, electrocatalysis is a promising technology for converting electric power into storable chemical fuels or value added chemical compounds. This has sparked the development of electrocatalysts that need to operate at high product selectivity and high energy efficiency. Electrocatalytic alcohol oxidation, oxygen activation, nitrogen and carbon dioxide reduction are examples of reactions with a huge industrial potential. Notably, electrocatalytic reduction of carbon dioxide has recently developed as a favourable pathway to convert this greenhouse gas into value added chemicals and fuels. Earth abundant metals stabilized by carbon/nitrogen macrocycle ligands are well-known efficient and selective catalysts for the electrochemical reduction of CO₂ in homogeneous conditions. Recently, such catalysts have also been used in supported conditions and implemented in flow cell electrolyzers, showing promising performances. This review provides a synopsis for the evolution of CO₂ electrolyzers employing molecular catalysts.

Keywords

CO₂ catalysis, molecular catalysts, flow cells, electrolyzers.

Introduction

Emission of carbon dioxide (CO₂) to an alarming atmospheric level has driven the search for materials capable of catalysing the CO₂ reduction reaction (CO₂RR). Combined with renewable energy, the electrocatalytic conversion of CO₂ is an appealing method for storing energy in the form of carbon-based fuels (e.g. methane, methanol and ethanol),[1] or for generating commodity chemicals (e.g. carbon monoxide, formic acid, ethanol and ethylene).[2, 3] With power-to-X approach employing CO₂ electrolyzers, ideally situated at local emission sources,

such renewable energy driven CO₂ conversion will help mitigating CO₂ emission and in addition generate valuable chemical feedstocks. With more and more countries taxing CO₂ emission (currently the tax per emitted tonne of CO₂ is around 150 € in many EU countries, a number that will likely increase in the future),[4] there is a growing economic incentive for the industry and governments to invest in the development of CO₂ electrolyzer plants. However, environment friendly electro-materials with high efficiencies are a prerequisite. Regarding the efficiency criteria, there is a consensus that electrolyzers must operate at current density >200 mA cm⁻², with the area measure referring to the geometric surface of the electrolyzer cathode.[5-7] Until recently, this value has only been approached with copper or precious metal catalysts such as silver and gold employed in gas diffusion CO₂ electrolyzers (see Table 1 for a summary of the state-of-the-art metrics). To reach higher performances, with respect to both current density and product selectivity, thorough mechanistic studies of the electrocatalytic CO₂RR are necessary. However, metallic coatings and nanoparticles typically include different grain boundaries, crystal defects, oxygen derived species and various open facets exposed to the reacting CO₂. [8, 9] To elucidate the structure-activity relationship of such complex surfaces, one must know in detail what are the active sites and the density of states responsible for the electrocatalytic CO₂-to-product conversion. *Operando* characterization methods are developing fast, albeit a tedious task regarding the nanometric scale of the active sites combined with beam attenuation in the electrolyte solution in operating electrolyzers.[10, 11]

Molecular catalysts provide well-defined and tunable reaction centres

When discrete molecules are employed as catalysts, mechanistic studies become more accessible. With activated molecules being all identical, catalytic activity would result in a characteristic response. Solution based spectro-electrochemical methods, cyclic voltammetry (CV) and preparative electrolysis have proven powerful tools for investigating

Figure 1. Selective electrocatalysts for the 2e⁻ reduction of CO₂. (a) Iron tetraphenyl porphyrin, (b) Cobalt quaterpyridine, (c) Nickel cyclam and (d) Manganese triscarbonyl di-*tert*-butyl bipyridine.

structure-activity relationship of various molecular catalysts in homogeneous conditions.[12-14] Using these relatively easy to implement electrochemical methods, catalytic Tafel plots relating the turnover frequency (TOF) to the applied overpotential can be obtained, providing a benchmark method for quantifying the catalytic activity and enabling comparison between different metal centres and ligand structures.[15] The most active molecular catalysts reported share a metal center coordinated to a tetradentate nitrogen-donor based ligand, such as porphyrins, phthalocyanines, polypyridines and cyclams, some examples being shown in Figure 1.[16-22] Further insight on homogenous electrocatalyzed CO₂RR using molecular catalysts can be found in recent reviews.[2, 3, 23]

Albeit homogeneous conditions are appropriate for deciphering the intrinsic activity of molecular catalysts, there are several barriers toward high substrate-to-product conversion efficiency. Main limitations consist in catalyst and substrate mass transfer to the electrode, and catalyst solubility which constrains the choice of electrolyte solution (e.g. few catalysts are soluble in water). Immobilization of the catalyst onto a conductive material can help solving these issues.

Supported molecular catalysts for the CO₂RR, an emerging approach with remaining challenges

The main strategies for catalyst immobilization are outlined in Figure 2.[24] They include physical adsorption, chemical bonding and integration into 3-D frameworks. Physical adsorption occurs *via* π - π , Van der Waals or electrostatic interactions between the molecular catalyst and the conductive support. With most reported molecular catalysts bearing conjugated organic ligands, π - π interactions are advantageous for immobilization on conjugated and

Figure 2. Strategies for the immobilization of molecular catalysts on conductive supports. (a) Physisorption via catalyst-support interactions, (b) chemisorption via catalyst-support linkage and (c) integration of the catalyst in a conjugated organic framework.

conductive support materials such as carbon nanotubes,[18] graphene[25] and carbon black particles.[26] Direct chemical bonding (or covalent grafting) of the catalyst to the support has been investigated, such as phosphonate linkage to a metal oxide[27, 28] or via diazonium and amide chemistry.[29] Such approach was developed by Zhu et al.,[30] for grafting a Co protoporphyrin at carbon nanotubes through covalent linkage between the support and the cobalt atom of the complex. It led to a current density for CO₂ reduction in an H-cell close to the substrate mass transfer limiting value (*vide infra*). In comparison with homogeneous conditions, enhanced catalytic activity upon catalyst immobilization has been observed in some cases.[31]

Integration of the catalyst into metal organic frameworks is another strategy providing porous materials with electronically addressed well-defined catalytic centres, although conductivity of such materials remains an issue.[32-35] The above mentioned examples have been beneficial in establishing a better comprehension of the CO₂RR in supported conditions and for the development of catalytic materials,[36] but mechanistic studies remain scarce and need to be vigorously developed. Additional difficulties toward this goal arise from the fact that only a fraction of the supported catalysts is active within films (the exact active surface concentration is not easily assessed). Moreover, the exact degree of electronic interaction between the molecules and the conductive support may vary from weak to strong coupling which may

Figure 3. (a) Schematic representation of the 3-phase (solid-liquid-gas) reaction interface in a gas diffusion electrode (GDE). (b) Sketch of a zero-gap electrolyzer without catholyte flow. (c) Sketch of an electrolyzer with both anolyte and catholyte flow. (d and e) Stability test of the cobalt phthalocyanine catalyst CoPc at constant current density of 50 mA cm⁻² in a zero-gap electrolyzer and in a flow cell electrolyzer, respectively.

impact both the catalytic activity and mechanisms. Practical applications are also still limited. Due to the low solubility of CO₂ in aqueous media (~34 mM at 298 K and 1 atm.), semi-infinite boundary diffusive models predict a limiting current density of ~35 mA cm⁻² for CO₂ conversion at planar electrodes.[37]

As mentioned in the introduction, electrolyzers mounted with vapour-fed gas diffusion electrodes (GDEs) and employing solid state precious metal catalysts are now reaching commercially relevant current densities for the CO₂RR. Such performance was made possible by increased mass transfer in the gas phase combined with a high density of catalytic sites at the 3-phase interface in the GDE, as illustrated in Figure 3a. Taking inspiration from such design may provide a route for implementing molecular catalysts made of earth abundant elements in electrolyzers meeting commercial requirements.

Illustrative advances and opportunities in using supported molecular catalysts in CO₂ electrolyzers

The use of molecular catalysts such as porphyrins and phthalocyanines at gas diffusion electrodes has been pioneered in the 80's and 90's, with current densities reaching a few tens of mA cm⁻². [38-40] Implementation of commercially available cobalt phthalocyanine (CoPc, Figure 4a) in a zero-gap electrolyzer was recently reported (Figure 3b). [41] The GDE employed was manufactured by spray coating an ink comprising carbon black supported CoPc onto hydrophobic carbon paper, and subsequently deposited at an anion exchange membrane. With a constant flow of humidified CO₂ to the GDE, performances (Faradaic efficiency for CO (FE_{CO}) and cell potential) were evaluated at current densities ranging from 25 to 200 mA cm⁻². FE_{CO} >95% was maintained at current densities up to 150 mA cm⁻², for which the cell potential was 2.43 V (energy efficiency (EE) of 52%). At higher current densities, FE_{CO} dropped rapidly, reaching 60% at 200 mA cm⁻². Such decrease is likely a consequence of the generation of hydroxide ions within the GDE (*vide infra*). The stability of the CoPc catalyst in the zero-gap electrolyzer was investigated at a current density of 50 mA cm⁻². As shown in Figure 3d, FE_{CO} could be maintained above 90% for more than 8 hours, corresponding to >4.000 catalytic cycles (CCs) for each active site. Hereafter, the FE_{CO} dropped quite rapidly. Hereafter, a gradual decrease reaching ~60% in the FE_{CO} was observed. Lack of long term stability in this zero-gap configuration was mainly ascribed to the formation of potassium carbonate on the cathode flow plate, obstructing the free flow of CO₂ to the GDE. This precipitation occurs when potassium ions cross the membrane from the anodic side and react with the carbonate, the latter being formed in large amounts with increasing current density.[42] Initial performance could be

regenerated after disassembling the electrolyzer and washing the precipitated salt, indicating that no molecular degradation of the catalyst had occurred. This was further confirmed by incorporating the GDE in a flow cell electrolyzer with a continuous flow of an electrolyte solution (0.5 M NaHCO₃) between the GDE and the membrane (Figure 3c). In such a configuration, a FE_{CO} above 80% was maintained for >100 hours at a current density of 50 mA cm⁻² (corresponding to ~16000 CCs), with no significant change of FE_{CO} and cell potential (Figure 3e). In this configuration, hydroxide ions are continuously removed by the electrolyte solution. However, this type of electrolyzer runs at lower EEs, due to an increased ohmic cell resistance.

CV studies of a cobalt phthalocyanine bearing one trimethyl ammonium group and three *tert*-butyl groups appended on the phthalocyanine macrocycle (CoPc2, Figure 4b) showed an ~25% increase in the catalytic activity towards CO₂-to-CO conversion compared to CoPc.[43] It was mainly ascribed to the through-space stabilizing effect on the Co(I)-CO₂⁻ adduct exerted by the positive charge on the quaternary ammonium appended to the macrocycle, as previously reported for an iron porphyrin.[16] CoPc2 was incorporated at a GDE which was inserted in a flow cell configuration using 1 M KOH as electrolyte solution. With a catalyst amount of only 0.2 mg cm⁻², a partial current density for CO (*j*_{CO}) of 112 mA cm⁻² (with 96% selectivity and an overpotential (*E*_{electrode} - *E*⁰_{CO₂/CO}) of 610 mV) was maintained for 3 hours. Each catalyst site endured 29000 CCs providing a turn over frequency of 2.7 s⁻¹. At an overpotential of 810 mV, a *j*_{CO} of 165 mA cm⁻² was reached (selectivity of 94%), matching state-of-the-art Ag based catalysts so far reported with respect to both current density and CO selectivity. Stability test at a current density of 75 mA cm⁻² provided an average selectivity of 94% for more than 10 hours. Post-electrolysis examination of the GDE (Co K-edge XANES spectroscopy) showed no degradation of the catalyst.

Figure 4. (a) Cobalt phthalocyanine (CoPc), (b) substituted cobalt phthalocyanine (CoPc2), (c) substituted tetraphenyl iron porphyrin (FeP).

Employing a cyano substituted CoPc adsorbed on carbon nanotubes, deposited at a GDE and inserted in a flow cell, Lu et al.[44] obtained a j_{CO} of 31 mA cm⁻² with a FE_{CO} of 94% (560 mV overpotential). A maximum j_{CO} of 82 mA cm⁻² was reached, with a FE_{CO} of ~50%. Further increase in the total current density (j_{total}) resulted in hydrogen production mainly. At FE_{CO} of ca. 90% and at a current density close to 40 mA cm⁻², performances were maintained during 10h.

Table 1. Metrics for state-of-the-art CO₂-to-CO metal and supported molecular catalysts.

Catalyst/ support	Main product and partial current density (mA cm ⁻²)	FE (%)	E (V vs RHE)	Electrolyte	Ref.
Ag/PTFE ^a grid	CO/150	90	-0.7	1 M KOH	[47]
Au/MWCNT ^b	CO/158	85	-0.55	2 M KOH	[48]
Cu/CP ^c	C ₂ H ₄ /473	63	-0.67	3.5 M KOH ^d	[49]
Ni SA/CF ^e	CO/308	88	-1.0	0.5 M KHCO ₃	[50]
CoPc2/CNP ^f	CO/165	94	-0.92	1 M KOH	[43]
FeP/CNP ^f	CO/152	98	-0.59	1 M KOH	[45]

^a Polytetrafluoroethylene. ^b Multi-walled carbon nanotubes. ^c Carbon paper. ^d Includes 5 M KI.

^e Single atom catalysts at carbon fiber. ^f Carbon nanoparticles.

In addition to tuning the catalyst structure, various parameters have been shown to influence cell performance. Using a substituted iron porphyrin (FeP, Figure 4c) based GDE, the cell temperature (T_{cell}) played a significant role on the catalytic performance.[45] At neutral pH (CO₂ saturated 0.5 M NaHCO₃ electrolyte solution), a 39% current density increase was obtained by increasing T_{cell} from 24 to 40 °C without compromising the CO selectivity. At 40 °C, a current density of 50 mA cm⁻² was maintained for 3 hours with an average CO selectivity as high as 98.6%. In addition, the overpotential was lowered by 300 mV compared to that needed to achieve the same current density at 24 °C, illustrating the positive impact of such moderate temperature increase. As it has been shown for solid metal based catalysts,[46] the electrolyte cation size has a significant impact on the electrochemical CO₂RR. Larger cations such as Cs⁺ induce a higher surface charge density at the cathode and favour the CO₂RR with stronger CO₂ affinity for the electrode surface. The same effect was observed for FeP immobilized on a carbon support in a flow cell with various bicarbonate species. At a fixed current density of 50 mA cm⁻², a significant lowering of the overpotential (and hence an increased energy efficiency) was observed with increasing cation size in the order Cs⁺ > K⁺ > Na⁺ as well as concomitant increase of selectivity. In alkaline conditions (1 M KOH), this

catalyst displayed promising metrics. At 470 mV overpotential, a current density of 155 mA cm⁻² was obtained with a CO selectivity >98%, better than noble metal catalysts performances.[47] At 50 mA cm⁻², a remarkably low overpotential of 120 mV was maintained over 3 hours, with 99.8% CO selectivity and 57% EE, with only hydrogen as a trace by-product.

Conclusions

Molecular catalysts implemented in CO₂ electrolyzers have shown promising performances, comparable to those of solid state precious metals. Their unexpected ability to maintain high selectivity at high rates for CO₂-to-CO conversion opens new perspectives, although several aspects need to be addressed in order to meet industrial demands, in particular regarding long term stability at high current densities. Mechanistic studies so as to understand the exact catalytic mechanisms and degradation pathways are, in combination with engineering efforts to overcome cathode blockage, key to improve electrolyzer performances. Furthermore, turnover frequencies so far obtained in flow cells are still several orders of magnitude lower than the values reported for the same catalysts in homogeneous conditions. Better control and understanding of catalyst insertion and dispersion within GDEs is a pre-requisite to increase performances, since it may lead to optimization of both electronic addressability and substrate interaction at the catalytic sites. Reported results for the CO₂-to-CO conversion will hopefully stimulate the development of improved CO₂ electrolyzers involving molecular catalysts, not only for CO production but also to get more reduced products such as methanol and methane, as well as C₂ and C₂₊ species.

Acknowledgement

Partial financial support from Air Liquide and from the Institut Universitaire de France (IUF) are gratefully acknowledged.

References

- [1] Whipple DT, Kenis PJA. Prospects of CO₂ Utilization via Direct Heterogeneous Electrochemical Reduction. *The Journal of Physical Chemistry Letters*. 2010;1:3451-8.
- [2] Benson EE, Kubiak CP, Sathrum AJ, Smieja JM. Electrocatalytic and homogeneous approaches to conversion of CO₂ to liquid fuels. *Chemical Society Reviews*. 2009;38:89-99.
- [3] Costentin C, Robert M, Savéant J-M. Catalysis of the electrochemical reduction of carbon dioxide. *Chemical Society Reviews*. 2013;42:2423-36.
- [4] Database of Institutional Comparison in Europe (DICE), www.cesifo.de.
- [5] Verma S, Kim B, Jhong H-RM, Ma S, Kenis PJA. A Gross-Margin Model for Defining Technoeconomic Benchmarks in the Electroreduction of CO₂. *ChemSusChem*. 2016;9:1972-9.

[6] Spurgeon JM, Kumar B. A comparative technoeconomic analysis of pathways for commercial electrochemical CO₂ reduction to liquid products. *Energy & Environmental Science*. 2018;11:1536-51.
 *[7] De Luna P, Hahn C, Higgins D, Jaffer SA, Jaramillo TF, Sargent EH. What would it take for renewably powered electrosynthesis to displace petrochemical processes? *Science*. 2019;364:eaav3506.

A techno-economic analysis allows for understanding of the technological, social-political and economic incentives necessary for the transition from a fossil energy stock relying society to a world based on renewable chemical (electro)synthesis.

[8] Clark EL, Ringe S, Tang M, Walton A, Hahn C, Jaramillo TF, Chan K, Bell AT. Influence of Atomic Surface Structure on the Activity of Ag for the Electrochemical Reduction of CO₂ to CO. *ACS Catalysis*. 2019;9:4006-14.

[9] Mezzavilla S, Horch S, Stephens IEL, Seger B, Chorkendorff I. Structure Sensitivity in the Electrocatalytic Reduction of CO₂ with Gold Catalysts. *Angewandte Chemie International Edition*. 2019;58:3774-8.

[10] Firet NJ, Blommaert MA, Burdyny T, Venugopal A, Bohra D, Longo A, Smith Wa. Operando EXAFS study reveals presence of oxygen in oxide-derived silver catalysts for electrochemical CO₂ reduction. *Journal of Materials Chemistry A*. 2019;7:2597-607.

[11] Heidary N, Ly KH, Kornienko N. Probing CO₂ Conversion Chemistry on Nanostructured Surfaces with Operando Vibrational Spectroscopy. *Nano Letters*. 2019;19:4817-26.

*[12] Costentin C, Savéant J-M. Multielectron, Multistep Molecular Catalysis of Electrochemical Reactions: Benchmarking of Homogeneous Catalysts. *ChemElectroChem*. 2014;1:1226-36.

Establishment of catalytic Tafel plots (Turnover frequency = $f(\text{Electrode overpotential})$) for two-electrons two-protons catalytic reaction processes from cyclic voltammetry experiments, allowing for rigorous comparison of intrinsic activities of homogeneous molecular catalysts.

[13] Azcarate I, Costentin C, Robert M, Savéant J-M. Dissection of Electronic Substituent Effects in Multielectron–Multistep Molecular Catalysis. Electrochemical CO₂-to-CO Conversion Catalyzed by Iron Porphyrins. *The Journal of Physical Chemistry C*. 2016;120:28951-60.

[14] Cometto C, Chen L, Lo P-K, Guo Z, Lau K-C, Anxolabéhère-Mallart E, Fave C, Lau T-C, Robert M. Highly Selective Molecular Catalysts for the CO₂-to-CO Electrochemical Conversion at Very Low Overpotential. Contrasting Fe vs Co Quaterpyridine Complexes upon Mechanistic Studies. *ACS Catalysis*. 2018;8:3411-7.

[15] Costentin C, Robert M, Savéant J-M. Molecular catalysis of electrochemical reactions. *Current Opinion in Electrochemistry*. 2017;2:26-31.

*[16] Azcarate I, Costentin C, Robert M, Savéant J-M. Through-Space Charge Interaction Substituent Effects in Molecular Catalysis Leading to the Design of the Most Efficient Catalyst of CO₂-to-CO Electrochemical Conversion. *J Am Chem Soc*. 2016;138:16639-44.

Example of rational tuning of a catalyst ligand structure to accelerate the kinetics ('through space' effects) and decrease the thermodynamic cost ('through structure' effect). It led the most efficient homogeneous molecular electrochemical catalyst so far known for the CO₂-to-CO conversion.

[17] Rønne MH, Cho D, Madsen MR, Jakobsen JB, Eom S, Escoudé É, Hammershøj HCD, Nielsen DU, Pedersen SU, Baik M-H, Skrydstrup T, Daasbjerg K. Ligand-Controlled Product Selectivity in Electrochemical Carbon Dioxide Reduction Using Manganese Bipyridine Catalysts. *J Am Chem Soc*. 2020;142:4265-75.

- [18] Wang M, Chen L, Lau T-C, Robert M. A Hybrid Co Quaterpyridine Complex/Carbon Nanotube Catalytic Material for CO₂ Reduction in Water. *Angewandte Chemie International Edition*. 2018;57:7769-73.
- [19] Froehlich JD, Kubiak CP. Homogeneous CO₂ Reduction by Ni(cyclam) at a Glassy Carbon Electrode. *Inorganic Chemistry*. 2012;51:3932-4.
- [20] Hawecker J, Lehn J-M, Ziessel R. Electrocatalytic reduction of carbon dioxide mediated by Re(bipy)(CO)₃Cl (bipy = 2,2'-bipyridine). *Journal of the Chemical Society, Chemical Communications*. 1984:328-30.
- [21] Khadhraoui A, Gotico P, Boitrel B, Leibl W, Halime Z, Aukauloo A. Local ionic liquid environment at a modified iron porphyrin catalyst enhances the electrocatalytic performance of CO₂ to CO reduction in water. *Chemical Communications*. 2018;54:11630-3.
- [22] Myren THT, Lilio AM, Huntzinger CG, Horstman JW, Stinson TA, Donadt TB, Moore C, Lama B, Funke HH, Luca OR. Manganese N-Heterocyclic Carbene Pincers for the Electrocatalytic Reduction of Carbon Dioxide. *Organometallics*. 2019;38:1248-53.
- [23] Francke R, Schille B, Roemelt M. Homogeneously Catalyzed Electroreduction of Carbon Dioxide—Methods, Mechanisms, and Catalysts. *Chem Rev*. 2018;118:4631-701.
- [24] Hu X-M, Pedersen SU, Daasbjerg K. Supported molecular catalysts for the heterogeneous CO₂ electroreduction. *Current Opinion in Electrochemistry*. 2019;15:148-54.
- [25] Choi J, Wagner P, Jalili R, Kim J, MacFarlane DR, Wallace GG, Officer DL. A Porphyrin/Graphene Framework: A Highly Efficient and Robust Electrocatalyst for Carbon Dioxide Reduction. *Advanced Energy Materials*. 2018;8:1801280.
- [26] Tatin A, Comminges C, Kokoh B, Costentin C, Robert M, Savéant J-M. Efficient electrolyzer for CO₂ splitting in neutral water using earth-abundant materials. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*. 2016;113:5526-9.
- [27] Mohamed EA, Zahran ZN, Naruta Y. Efficient Heterogeneous CO₂ to CO Conversion with a Phosphonic Acid Fabricated Cofacial Iron Porphyrin Dimer. *Chemistry of Materials*. 2017;29:7140-50.
- [28] Wang Y, Marquard SL, Wang D, Dares C, Meyer TJ. Single-Site, Heterogeneous Electrocatalytic Reduction of CO₂ in Water as the Solvent. *ACS Energy Letters*. 2017;2:1395-9.
- [29] Maurin A, Robert M. Catalytic CO₂-to-CO conversion in water by covalently functionalized carbon nanotubes with a molecular iron catalyst. *Chemical Communications*. 2016;52:12084-7.
- [30] Zhu M, Chen J, Huang L, Ye R, Xu J, Han Y-F. Covalently Grafting Cobalt Porphyrin onto Carbon Nanotubes for Efficient CO₂ Electroreduction. *Angewandte Chemie International Edition*. 2019;58:6595-9.
- *[31] Hu X-M, Rønne MH, Pedersen SU, Skrydstrup T, Daasbjerg K. Enhanced Catalytic Activity of Cobalt Porphyrin in CO₂ Electroreduction upon Immobilization on Carbon Materials. *Angewandte Chemie International Edition*. 2017;56:6468-72.

Example of thorough comparison of catalytic performances for a molecular CO₂ catalyst between homogeneous and supported conditions. This work shows the effectiveness of simple immobilisation strategies relying on weak catalyst-support interactions.

- [32] Lin S, Diercks CS, Zhang Y-B, Kornienko N, Nichols EM, Zhao Y, R. Paris AR, Kim D, Yang P, Yaghi OM, Chang CJ. Covalent organic frameworks comprising cobalt porphyrins for catalytic CO₂ reduction in water. *Science*. 2015;349:1208-13.
- [33] Diercks CS, Lin S, Kornienko N, Kapustin EA, Nichols EM, Zhu C, Zhao Yingbo, Chang CJ, Yaghi OM. Reticular Electronic Tuning of Porphyrin Active Sites in Covalent Organic Frameworks for Electrocatalytic Carbon Dioxide Reduction. *J Am Chem Soc*. 2018;140:1116-22.
- [34] Wang Y-R, Huang Q, He C-T, Chen Y, Liu J, Shen F-C, et al. Oriented electron transmission in polyoxometalate-metalloporphyrin organic framework for highly selective electroreduction of CO₂. *Nature Communications*. 2018;9:4466.

- [35] Matheu R, Gutierrez-Puebla E, Monge MÁ, Diercks CS, Kang J, Prévot MS, Pei X, Hanikel N, Zhang B, Yang P, Yaghi OM. Three-Dimensional Phthalocyanine Metal-Catecholates for High Electrochemical Carbon Dioxide Reduction. *J Am Chem Soc.* 2019;141:17081-5.
- [36] Corbin N, Zeng J, Williams K, Manthiram K. Heterogeneous molecular catalysts for electrocatalytic CO₂ reduction. *Nano Research.* 2019;12:2093-125.
- [37] Bohra D, Chaudhry JH, Burdyny T, Pidko EA, Smith WA. Modeling the electrical double layer to understand the reaction environment in a CO₂ electrocatalytic system. *Energy & Environmental Science.* 2019;12:3380-9.
- *[38] Mahmood MN, Masheder D, Harty CJ. Use of gas-diffusion electrodes for high-rate electrochemical reduction of carbon dioxide. II. Reduction at metal phthalocyanine-impregnated electrodes. *Journal of Applied Electrochemistry.* 1987;17:1223-7.

In this avant-garde work, molecular catalysts were immobilised at carbon material (gas diffusion electrode) leading to high current density and selectivity for CO₂ reduction.

- [39] Furuya N, Koide S. Electroreduction of carbon dioxide by metal phthalocyanines. *Electrochimica Acta.* 1991;36:1309-13.
- [40] Sonoyama N, Kirii M, Sakata T. Electrochemical reduction of CO₂ at metal-porphyrin supported gas diffusion electrodes under high pressure CO₂. *Electrochemistry Communications.* 1999;1:213-6.
- *[41] Ren S, Joulié D, Salvatore D, Torbensen K, Wang M, Robert M, Berlinguette CP. Molecular electrocatalysts can mediate fast, selective CO₂ reduction in a flow cell. *Science.* 2019;365:367-9.

Molecular catalysts based on earth abundant metals can rival state-of-the art noble metal electrocatalysts for CO₂-to-CO conversion in electrolyzers.

- [42] Li YC, Yan Z, Hitt J, Wycisk R, Pintauro PN, Mallouk TE. Bipolar Membranes Inhibit Product Crossover in CO₂ Electrolysis Cells. *Advanced Sustainable Systems.* 2018;2:1700187.
- [43] Wang M, Torbensen K, Salvatore D, Ren S, Joulié D, Dumoulin F, Mendoza D, Lassalle-Kaiser B, Işci U, Berlinguette CP, Robert M. CO₂ electrochemical catalytic reduction with a highly active cobalt phthalocyanine. *Nature Communications.* 2019;10:3602.
- [44] Lu X, Wu Y, Yuan X, Huang L, Wu Z, Xuan J, Wang Y, Wang H. High-Performance Electrochemical CO₂ Reduction Cells Based on Non-noble Metal Catalysts. *ACS Energy Letters.* 2018;3:2527-32.
- [45] Torbensen K, Han C, Boudy B, von Wolff N, Bertail C, Braun W, Robert M. Iron Porphyrin Allows Fast and Selective Electrocatalytic Conversion of CO₂ to CO in a Flow Cell. *Chemistry – A European Journal.* 2020;26:3034-8.
- [46] Ringe S, Clark EL, Resasco J, Walton A, Seger B, Bell AT, Chan K. Understanding cation effects in electrochemical CO₂ reduction. *Energy & Environmental Science.* 2019;12:3001-14.
- [47] Dinh C-T, García de Arquer FP, Sinton D, Sargent EH. High Rate, Selective, and Stable Electroreduction of CO₂ to CO in Basic and Neutral Media. *ACS Energy Letters.* 2018;3:2835-40.
- [48] Verma S, Hamasaki Y, Kim C, Huang W, Lu S, Jhong H-RM, Gewirth AA, Fujigaya T, Naotoshi N, Kenis PJA. Insights into the Low Overpotential Electroreduction of CO₂ to CO on a Supported Gold Catalyst in an Alkaline Flow Electrolyzer. *ACS Energy Letters.* 2018;3:193-8.
- [49] Dinh C-T, Burdyny T, Kibria MG, Seifitokaldani A, Gabardo CM, García de Arquer FP, Kiani A, Edwards JP, De Luna P, Bushuyev OS, Zou C, Quintero-Bermudez R, Pang Y, Sinton D, Sargent EH. CO₂ electroreduction to ethylene via hydroxide-mediated copper catalysis at an abrupt interface. *Science.* 2018;360:783-7.
- [50] Yang H, Lin Q, Zhang C, Yu X, Cheng Z, Li G, Hu Q, Ren X, Zhang Q, Liu J, He C. Carbon dioxide electroreduction on single-atom nickel decorated carbon membranes with industry compatible current densities. *Nature Communications.* 2020;11:593.