Embodying pacification processes.
The case of the Brazilian urban public spaces.

Dr. Rachel THOMAS
CRESSON - Centre for research on sonic space and urban environment
UMR CNRS/MCC/ECN 1563 « Ambiances, Architectures, Urbanités »
National School of Architecture
60 avenue de Constantine - CS 126 36
38036 Grenoble Cedex 2

rachel.thomas@grenoble.archi.fr

Rachel Thomas. Embodying pacification processes. The case of the Brazilian urban public spaces. *Association of American Geographers Annual Meeting, Session "Affect, Politics and the Spaces of Embodied Practice*", Association of American Geographers, Mar 2016, San Francisco, United States. ⟨hal-01886248⟩

How the politics of pacification developed by the Brazilian government – wich transform the spaces of the mobility and the urban ambiences – put the pedestrian sensibilities and the manners by which city-dwellers share the spaces of movement to the test ? In other words, how does 'being together' occur and reveal itself in complex, urban environments subject to considerable movement but also to rationales driven by standardization, security and aseptisation ? Finally, can a work on ambiences and 'bodily states' allow to improve a critical analysis on contemporary urbanity ?
For four years, during a work programme funded by France's National Research Agency (ANR) on 'the sensory enigmas of contemporary urban mobilities' (Thomas et alii, 2014). these questions were examined by French and Brazilian researchers from three fields : urban sociology, architecture and dance.

In 2008 (two thousand eight), this group of researchers had attended the first attempts of pacification of favelas in Rio de Janeiro, which the main was to break the hold of the gangs on these informal territories and their inhabitants. And a few years later, in 2010 two thousand ten), the team noticed that the pacification processes being applied to public urban spaces.
The term 'pacification process' refers to all the policies and schemes for recovering urban territories, controlling uses and flows, restoring order in public urban space which have been deployed since 2008 (two thousand eight) in Brazil's main metropolises in the context of world sports events (Soccer World Cup in 2014 (two thousand fourteen); Olympics Games in

2016 (two thousand sixteen) (Chetry et Legroux, 2014). To Salvador da Bahia (in north-eastern Brazil) where we investigated, the presence of the armed military police increases. She patrols day and night (by foot, by car, in motorcycle), multiplies arrests and searches. The most deprived populations ('inhabitants and street children', people reduced to begging) are systematically rejected outside the city, because their lifestyle is considered harmful for the image of Salvador and the urban safety (Séchet, 2006). The number of itinerant dealer is limited from now to clear the space and increase its cleanliness. Besides these strategies to recovery the public space, strategies to aestheticise it increase ('facadism', bring out the historic architectural heritage, 'pedestrianization'). Their aim is to develop it attractiveness, in particular with the tourists.
In order, cleaned and aestheticised, the public place would so guarantee an appeased urbanity. But we make nevertheless the hypothesis that these pacification processes are similar to new forms of 'hygiénism' wich – by damaging the ordinary sensory life – affect profoundly the pedestrian sensibilities and the relationship to the Other (Simmel, 1903). In other words, by damaging the physical, social, visual, sound, tactile frames… in which the pedestrians move, the pacification processes transform the manners to walk, to feel and to be/to live together in a common world in the words of Hannah Arendt.

Adopting the opposite approach to the 'spatializing' methods used to build contemporary urban societies, our research set out to describe the arrangements by which city-dwellers share the spaces of movement. We wanted to know how this sharing process was orchestrated in contexts of mobility, a difficult task because it was violent, chaotic, unpredictable and saturated in both social and sensory terms. What forms of know-how and 'know-being' does the pedestrian bring into play? How does such savvy come to terms with the material and sensory resources of the spaces? At the same time we wish to report the processes by which this sensory experience is embodied in everyday urban life.
But our approach was tricky for two reasons. The question itself we had raised – regarding the onset of 'pacification' in the public space, in other words beyond the initial spatial limits of the favelas – upset our Brazilian colleagues. The debate, which was politically controversial, challenged their group and finally they collectively expressed substantial reservations about use of the expression "pacification of urban public spaces.". There were also problems in terms of notoriety. What image(s) of Brazil might a group of foreign researchers convey by addressing these public spaces from such a problematic angle?
The second difficulty we had to cope with related to how to register these dynamics. For this we must find a suitable survey methodology. Here again, the fact that we were foreigners was a handicap: over and above our lack of familiarity with the ordinary rituals of street behaviour, this status could, in the eyes of our Brazilian colleagues and the surrounding academic community – whose work has in the past been influenced by French philosophical thought and literature – put us in a superior position. Similarly, our suggestion to use video as part of this research action prompted deep misgivings. We might steal pictures of an unsuspecting public. In turn the pictures once circulated (even in a strictly academic context, subject to clear ethical guidelines) might give rise to overly negative interpretation of the reality of Brazilian society. In this light, video became 'a real weapon'. Our Brazilian fellows used this expression several times in the course of debate. So the risk of being perceived as domineering or of using unsuitable tools might have curtailed debate, endangered our work

together and distracted us from the complex reality which we sought to grasp. The question was how we should proceed in the field in practical terms and what stance we should adopt.

Questions of this sort might appear naïve to any researcher involved in ethnological or anthropological inquiry, but in the field of architectural and planning research in which our two teams were engaged, such issues are more unusual. In a context in which spatial determinism is still powerful, it is no easy matter to grasp the changes at work in and the complexity of the contemporary city in terms of its social and sensory modulations. Furthermore, positing that methodological invention (or even experimentation) might be necessary in view of what the terrain is, allows, produces and/or displaces in terms of the researcher's previous assumptions, represents a significant, often disputed move.

With our brasilian colleagues, the need to 'work together in the field' emerged. Part of the idea is to ask what the 'field' means for both teams and how engaged researchers are, in situ and for the duration. We shared the idea that the field was a shifting spatial, social and sensory context where researchers could observe the way urban life unfolds, where the urban weaves its ordinary relation with the environment engaging not only the sensory modalities of the space but also the perception and affects of the citizen. It was also agreed that the field – in the sense of the researcher's position in it – is never neutral and that both influence one another.
Our investigations focused on two field sites in Salvador da Bahia: Praça da Piedade and Porto da Barra. One – Praça da Piedade – is a working-class square, fully occupied by the residents of nearby streets who have made it their habitual dwelling place. Despite the installation of a forged-iron fence closing off the central part, numerous attempts to drive people out and the increased presence of armed security forces, quick to intervene, local residents have kept control over this space, acting implicitly on the way pedestrians move about there and loiter, preventing access to it altogether at night and at weekends.
Porto da Barra is a neighbourhood on the seafront, with a splendid view of the ocean for visitors and local people. But behind this postcard image, the apparently laid-back behaviour and cordial exchanges, is a highly structured framework with no scope for people's respective positions to shift one way or the other, where supervision is constant and peace is only maintained by means of an implicit balance of power and negotiations to apportion territory and trajectories.

By engaging bodily with Praça da Piedade and Porto da Barra, and creating spaces between ourselves in which to share – in other words to compare and translate our situated experiences – we were able to work together in the field. Over a period of four years, between two thousand and ten (2010) and two thousand and fourteen (2014) sometimes for short stays lasting a week or two, sometimes for longer, staying as much as four months, our two teams repeatedly walked together1.
Walking – although it was chosen as the mode of investigation – was also made necessary by the field. Due to the sometimes dangerous character of public space in Brazil, static

[1] All these experiments can be found at http://www.anr-muse.fr

observation put members of the French delegation at risk. But walking, which is quite usual in Europe and North America, also surprised the Brazilian team, unfamiliar with a form of locomotion generally restricted to the poorest people in the South. So for each of us an effort was required to come to terms with the field and unlearn preconceived images, gestures, attitudes and ways of observing, so that we could truly adapt to the setting. In the case of the French team, our first immersion sessions forced us to rid ourselves of all accessories. It was impossible to take photographs (except on the sly), to film, record, carry telephones or bags. By necessity our bodies alone became tools for observing and grasping the surroundings. For much of the Brazilian team this process of adaptation to their surroundings involved keeping at less of a distance, slowly accepting exposure to the elements (overpowering heat and abundant rain), to the crowd, its sounds and smells.

Each 'collective urban walk'2 was therefore an opportunity for the researchers to come 'to grips' with their surroundings. The first walks led us to pay attention and qualify the ambiances of both sites, their sociability, the ways in which the various forms of travel and transport were orchestrated. Out of habit, visual observation was predominant. But we listened attentively too, particularly among the French researchers, as much because of their training in sound as for the strangeness of what was to be heard. But very soon the surrounding hyperesthesia stirred all our senses. Repeating these immersion sessions caused us to slip with each step from attending to the qualities of the environment to 'what the ambiances do to my body, my attention, my gait and availability to others'. It also made us sensitive to tiny details, which gradually made themselves felt revealing the implicit nature of pacification, sensitive to all that goes unnoticed in spoken language (Piette, 1996; Datchary, 2013). In the long term we came to grasp these cyclical transformations in the ordinary sensory life of Praça da Piedade and Porto da Barra, the clear changes but also the modulations, instabilities and oscillations of ambiences and affects. We developed an almost choreographic bodily sensibility, in so far as these tiny variations were registered in our bodies and shaped our movements. The discussions with our fellow choreographers and dancers were particularly stimulating, because they gave us a greater awareness of this embodying process and allowed us to express it in words.

On each occasion we transcribed our experiences in situ. The sharing of experience took various forms: oral accounts, sketches, drawings, mime and performance, among others. The challenge – in multiplying the number of these descriptive forms – was to find the means not to illustrate the field locations but to translate they way they tested us and called into question our views on pacification. These sensory accounts were recorded in blogs (drafted in Portuguese and French)3, which not only kept a record but carried on the discussion at a distance (outside the time spent in the field). With time various strata formed in these blogs, as our of descriptions and analyses evolved. By sharing our views in this way, on the basis of repeated immersion sessions, we finally succeeded in revealing the many forms of pacification.

[2] About 25 people, divided into five equal groups, took part in these walks on a regular basis, each one lasting one hour and 15 minutes, on average. Groups always comprised Brazilian and French researchers and students.

[3] http://apaisement.wordpress.com (French) and http://atelier5ufba.blogspot.fr (Portuguese)

Our analysis allows today to propose an exploratory typology of **'bodily states'** adopted by the pedestrian in a context of pacification processes: the mobilization, the sublimation, the tension, the saturation, the worried vigilance, the intense vigilance and the availability (http://www.anr-muse.fr/#mouvements).
Through this typology and the bend by the notion of 'bodily states' – we borrow the vocabulary of dance and a particular author, Philippe Guisgand – we wish to make understandable the importance of what we shall call 'the driving empathy' on embodying pacification processes.
In dance, the 'bodily states' (Guisgand, 2004) qualify the life force by which the body of the dancer expresses (by the tension, the relaxation, the amplitude of gestures, changes of rhythms…) not these only feelings, but a certain presence to the world in a particular frame (scenic and interpretative). This 'sensitive arrangement to move' (Féral, 2012) configure a particular relationship with the spectator and transforms the space-time lived in common in opportunity of sharing. We make the hypothesis that this 'driving empathy' is also at work when the pedestrians share the urban public place by walking, but it is altered by the pacification processes. Through the description of a range of 'bodily states' adopted by the pedestrian, we can now show how deploying a pacification process constrains the ordinary modalities of living together and calls into question the status of public space as a common good.

I will take three examples

The state of mobilisation

The mobilisation asks how ambiance seeks pedestrian vigilance and possibilities to act in public.
In Porto da Barra as Praça da Piedade, the animation is not an agitation, but a manifestation of the vitality of the neighbourhood. It varies in intensity during the day. It exacerbates conflicts of use and the street problems. It is connected with commercial activities and traffic. The manner that street vendors invest the sidewalks and the street, the processes by which they call the customer keep the neighbourhood in a sort of bubbling. This sort of an "invasion" of the street and the sidewalk is seen in a multitude of gestures and objects: push, pull, lift the rolling stock; place, shut down, suspend handicrafts; cut, wrap, fry, food; step over the railing to Barra, lean against the gate to Piedade, slalom between the obstacles. It is also visible among the inhabitants of the street, late in the day, roam the site to install a few boxes to sleep, clean their old clothes, inspect the bins in search of food. In Barra, it is at its peak when, at the weekend, passers invest the sidewalk for a *paséo*.
On both grounds, the agitation is present on the floor when, during peak hours, the noisy parade bus increases, giving to see pedestrians cohorts hailing the drivers, hurrying to get inside when younger cling to even the body of the vehicle. It is also visible in car traffic, intense at times, which really seems to "take power" on the pedestrian traffic, abusing the horn, forcing everyone to hurry up, to "look twice before committing ". In addition to Barra as Piedade, this state of mobilisation increases when the security background is exacerbated when the military police - both mobile and visible - introduces, behind the image of an apparent "bazaar "guidance and supervision of extremely binding body. This arbitrary set makes problematic the commitment of the pedestrian by testing the acceptability of these actions. The possibility of the formation and participation in the collective is fragile: if there

is an "experience in common" in the mobilisation, it is available often in discomfort, stiffness, tension that promotes increased distance the other.

The state of alertness or an « anxious vigilance »

At nightfall in Piedade, mobilisation becomes anxious vigilance. The trajectories avoid the centre of the square; faster you walk when the presence of street people increases and when the hawkers decrease. Obstacles are currently less but attention does not relax. The eyes scan the shadows, hearing sharpens, bodies tend.

We find the same fail over Porto da Barra. But it is more gradual. At sunset when the traffic noise is sporadic, when the trees draw large corners of darkness, each spy. During the night, the two neighbourhoods sink into illegality (sale and purchase of drugs, illicit trade of goods, prostitution). Street people take possession of the territory and set up a place to sleep, eat, wash. If monitoring and supervising body still exists, they change their nature and become divided: less tangible, as related to the presence of the police as that of the inhabitants of the streets, prostitutes, traffickers, they are part of a malaise, a nervousness, a disorder. The pedestrian hurried on to take refuge in the houses and thus escape to the outside, to the Other. In this state, the desire to be and to act with others in this space is questioned as a condition of sharing.

Both fiels also are sometimes subjected to fail over, including the speed and degree of intensity can range from simple imbalances in tension. Pedestrians become in a state of intense alertness. These fail overs, subtle to grasp, come when there is a break, a gradual transition from one ambience to another or a precarious balance of the ambience. Each time, these fractures occur through the intensification of the pacification process or when the background safe neighbourhoods are deficient. It is the unexpected deployment and number of police patrols, the sudden visibility of patrols which puts the senses alert, generates tension, feels that each weighs on itself a load. This is often silent arrest of an individual by uniformed police, the presence of armed police but which create tension and puts in motion, collectively rising anxiety, fear. However, the collective is not undermined by those states. Vigilance is sharing. It makes palpable a means of participating in the space of the order of conflict, of a « dissentiment » to speak as Jacques Rancière (1995).

The State of Saturation

The state of saturation is more related to an overload, an "overflow". In Porto da Barra, it is the dull bubbling perceptible at each weekend evening. At Piedade, this is the sound glut caused by the multiplicity of individual sound systems (musical broadcasts of street vendors, advertising or political harangue) that adds to the rumour instead. This is also what "fulfilment" visual, due to resonance of colours and textures, which limits the projection of the eyes, discomfort discrimination of ordinary scenes.

In Barra, saturation is related to hyperaesthesia of the neighbourhood. It's the smell of the sea, fried palm oil, cooking, garbage trucks, gasoline ... that attracts, sickens, is that it "fills the lungs" or that one "through snorkelling. These are the brake noise, honking, tires screeching, loud music from vehicles startled, prevents listening, discussing with others, the concentration necessary to the success of a course. It is the heat of the sun and heat that burns the skin is sweat, hamper walking. That is glare which requires lowering the head, blink or blind as not to see obstacles. These are the faces and bodies so close to each other

on the sidewalk he must not touch and sometimes arouse feelings of discomfort or choking ; this extreme self-exposure that needs both assume and manage. It is this vigilance at all times accompanying a chaotic walk, made of turns, acceleration and trampling, repeated avoidance.
The saturation state reveals the exposure of pedestrians to a significant oversupply, which can be of the order of the excess as the fullness and does not prevent the « copresence », the fact « to be together ». This state questions the quality of hospitality of ambiance, that is to say their ability to host body moving under constant pressure and whose objectives, rhythms, ways of walking differ. More than the peace process at work and how they can restore social peace by promoting harmony and agreement, the saturation state only emphasises the unexpected every day, break and glitches, the modulations as a condition for sharing.

In other words, the implementation of peace process in urban public spaces not only transforms the physical framework for the pedestrian moves. It processes over the long term urban environments, reducing their intensity, by unifying and prioritizing instead of sensitive terms in space. Examples of Porto da Barra and Praça da Piedade testify to the advent of a new form of hygienism - which we call « sensitive hygienism » - which today seems to spread in numbers of cities and the effects on the body and the ordinary sensory experience are evident. If they lead to the adoption of new rhythms and new gestures if they reconfigure patterns of attention to space and to others, they are also putting the body directly to the test. By "testing", we mean the testing of specific sensory experiences. Slowly transforming the conditions of walking and co-presence, the peace process finally act on "the common experience background" (Füzesséry and Simay, 2008) pedestrian from which built the feeling of "being-with" "make whole" to "have a responsibility." Use the notion of state bodies accept these changes. It finally reveals how the construction of urbanity committed spatial and social, and also ambiences and affects.