Efficiency of plasma elaborated sub-stoichiometric titanium oxide (Ti4O7) ceramic electrode for advanced electrochemical degradation of paracetamol in different electrolyte media

S.O. Ganiyu, Nihal Oturan, Stéphane Raffy, Marc Cretin, Christel Causserand, Mehmet A. Oturan

To cite this version:
S.O. Ganiyu, Nihal Oturan, Stéphane Raffy, Marc Cretin, Christel Causserand, et al.. Efficiency of plasma elaborated sub-stoichiometric titanium oxide (Ti4O7) ceramic electrode for advanced electrochemical degradation of paracetamol in different electrolyte media. Separation and Purification Technology, Elsevier, 2019, 208, pp.142-152. 10.1016/j.seppur.2018.03.076. hal-01805037

HAL Id: hal-01805037
https://hal.archives-ouvertes.fr/hal-01805037
Submitted on 17 Dec 2018

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L’archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire HAL, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d’enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.
Open Archive Toulouse Archive Ouverte (OATAO)

OATAO is an open access repository that collects the work of Toulouse researchers and makes it freely available over the web where possible.

This is an author’s version published in: http://oatao.univ-toulouse.fr/21053

Official URL: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seppur.2018.03.076

To cite this version:

Ganiyu, Soliu O. and Oturan, Nihal and Raffy, Stéphane and Cretin, Marc and Causerand, Christel and Oturan, Mehmet A. Efficiency of plasma elaborated sub-stoichiometric titanium oxide (Ti4O7) ceramic electrode for advanced electrochemical degradation of paracetamol in different electrolyte media. (2019) Separation and Purification Technology, 208. 142-152. ISSN 1383-5866

Any correspondence concerning this service should be sent to the repository administrator: tech-oatao@listes-diff.inp-toulouse.fr
Efficiency of plasma elaborated sub-stoichiometric titanium oxide (Ti$_4$O$_7$) ceramic electrode for advanced electrochemical degradation of paracetamol in different electrolyte media

Soliu O. Ganiyu$^a$, Nihal Oturan$^{a,⁎}$, Stéphane Raffy$^b$, Marc Cretin$^c$, Cristel Causerand$^d$, Mehmet A. Oturan$^a$

$^a$ Université Paris-Est, Laboratoire Génie Chimique, Université de Toulouse, CNRS, INPT, UPS, Toulouse, France
$^b$ Saint-Gobain C.R.E.E., 550 Avenue Alphonse Jauvert, 84300 Cavaillon, France
$^c$ Laboratoire de Génie Chimique et Moléculaire, Université de Montpellier, IEM (Institut Européen des Membranes), UMR 5635 (CNRS-ENSCM-UM), Université de Montpellier Place E. Bataillon, F-34095 Montpellier, Cedex 5, France
$^d$ Laboratoire Géomatériaux et Environnement (EA 4508), UPEM, 77454 Marne-la-Vallée, France

A R T I C L E   I N F O
Keywords:
Ti$_4$O$_7$-ceramic anode
Anodic oxidation
Electro-Fenton
Hydroxyl radicals
Supporting electrolyte
TOC removal efficiency

A B S T R A C T
This paper investigates the behavior of conductive Ti$_4$O$_7$ ceramic anode in different electrolytes during the degradation of the anti-inflammatory drug paracetamol (PCM) by advanced electrochemical oxidation processes mainly anodic oxidation with generation of H$_2$O$_2$ (AO-H$_2$O$_2$) and electro-Fenton (EF). Regardless of the medium, better degradation and mineralization efficiency was always observed with EF compared to AO-H$_2$O$_2$. The degradation of PCM was carried out by hydroxyl radical (•OH) produced on the anode surface from water oxidation and mediated oxidation in the solution from oxidant species generated at the anode such as sulfate radicals and active chlorine species depending on the supporting electrolytes used, as well as •OH generated homogeneously in the solution by electrochemically assisted Fenton’s reaction. Faster degradation was observed in Cl$^−$ compared to other media, but the solution was poorly mineralized. Highest total organic (TOC) removal efficiency with excellent degradation rate was attained in SO$_4^{2−}$ with either process, thus remain the best medium for advanced electrochemical wastewater treatment. Comparative studies with dimensional stable anode (DSA) and boron-doped diamond anode (BDD) showed similar trend of degradation and TOC removal efficiency with DSA anode achieving low mineralization power compared to Ti$_4$O$_7$, whereas BDD showed slightly better efficiency than Ti$_4$O$_7$ in all electrolytes studied. The analysis of concentration of generated active chlorine species, especially ClO$^−$, during AO-H$_2$O$_2$ decreased in the order: DSA > Ti$_4$O$_7$ > BDD. Therefore, the Ti$_4$O$_7$ electrode was found to be a promising anode material for an efficient treatment of PCM in SO$_4^{2−}$, NO$_3^{−}$ and ClO$_4^{−}$ media but less effective in Cl$^−$ medium.

1. Introduction

Electrochemical advanced oxidation processes (EAOPs) as an alternative treatment technique for organic-contaminated wastewater has been extensively developed and studied in the last two decades due to their versatility, environmental compatibility, high energy efficiency and amenability to automation [1–4]. The oxidative degradation and efficient removal of organic pollutant in EAOPs is achieved by means of in-situ generated hydroxyl radical (•OH), which is a very reactive non-selective reagent and strong oxidant (second strongest oxidant known after fluorine) [5–6]. Among EAOPs, anodic oxidation (AO) and electro-Fenton (EF) processes in which •OH are generated either at the surface of the high-oxygen overpotential anode (M) via water oxidation (Eq. (1)) and/or in the bulk through electrochemically assisted Fenton reaction (Eq. (2)) are the most widely studied processes due to their excellent efficiency and ease of operation [1,3,5,9,10].

\[
M + H_2O \rightarrow M(OH)^{−} + H^+ + e^− \\
Fe^{2+} + H_2O_2 + H^+ \rightarrow Fe^{3+} + •OH + H_2O
\]

Equations (1) and (2) represent the Fenton reaction and the Fenton-like reaction, respectively. In these equations, M represents the anode material, and •OH is the hydroxyl radical generated at the anode. These reactions are initiated by the decomposition of H$_2$O$_2$ by the amphoteric properties of the anode material M to form hydroxyl radicals (•OH) and hydrogen peroxide (H$_2$O$_2$), which can be reoxidized by the active chlorine species (ClO$^−$, ClO$_2^−$, and ClO$_4^{−}$).

Additionally, when treated solution containing high concentration of chloride ions (i.e. reverse osmosis concentrate), active chlorine species such as Cl$^−$, ClO$^−$, ClO$_2^−$, and ClO$_4^{−}$, are generated (Eqs. (3–5)) (depending on the pH of the solution) in parallel with •OH and/or M•OH and can involve in the degradation of organic pollutants [5,8,11,12]. However, this action is often accompanied by the formation of highly toxic...
choloramines, trithalomethanes, and haloacetic acids as well as refractory organochlorinated intermediates that are very toxic and difficult to mineralize [13-15]. This implies that the type of oxidants generated during electrochemical treatments and in turn, the efficiency of process is strongly influence by the medium/electrolyte in which the treatment is being carried out.

\[2\text{Cl}_2 \rightarrow 2\text{Cl}^{-} + 2\text{e}^{-}\]  (3)

\[\text{Cl}_2\text{(aq)} + \text{H}_2\text{O} \rightarrow \text{HClO} + \text{Cl}^{-} + \text{H}^{+}\]  (4)

\[\text{HClO} \rightarrow \text{ClO}^{-} + \text{H}^{+}\]  (5)

Ceramic electrode based on sub-stoichiometric TiO₂ developed in 80's for application as electrodes in batteries, sensors and corrosion protection has recently been investigated as an alternative low-cost anode material for possible application in electrochemical wastewater treatment [16-22]. The structural, electrical, electrochemical as well as corrosion behavior of bare and coated electrodes made from these material are available in literature [16,23-25]. They are majorly prepared by reduction of stoichiometric TiO₂, which is one of the most abundant feedstock on the planet [18,26]. Studies have shown that the sub-stoichiometric TiO₂ such as Ti₄O₇ behave as “non-active” anode as it have a large O₂ evolution overvoltage, can generate weakly adsorbed “OH (M(OH)) from water oxidation and therefore achieve high mineralization of organic pollutants [16,27,28]. Their electrochemical oxidation ability is significantly better than that of active anodes like DSA or Pt but slightly lower than that of BDD anode [16]. Most studies that have been conducted with sub-stoichiometric TiO₂ for electrochemical wastewater treatment application including the recent studies from our group, were carried out in sulfate medium [19,20,26,28]. Therefore, there is need for investigating the performance behavior of this electrode in other media such as chloride, nitrate and chlorate in order to understand its efficacy and suitability for electrochemical wastewater treatment.

Paracetamol (PCM), also known as acetaminophen or N-(p-hydroxyphenyl)-acetamide, is one of the most frequently used drugs worldwide, and has been found in sewage effluents at concentration up to 6.0–10 µg L⁻¹ [29,30]. Contamination from manufacturing wastes/site may also be the source of this compound in environment and its detection is greater in urban centers where huge quantities of the drug usage are expected [31]. Although, the adverse health effects of low amounts of pharmaceuticals in natural water bodies has not been well proven, there are grown concern about their possible toxicity and health implications due to their fast distribution and accumulation in environment [32-34]. Their accumulation in aquatic environment is majorly due to inadequacy of the treatment techniques currently applied in wastewater treatment plants, which can only achieve partial destruction of the pollutants [8,35,36].

Advanced oxidation processes such as ozonation, UV-peroxidation (UV/H₂O₂) and Fe⁴⁺, Cu⁴⁺ and UV catalyzed oxidation have been reported to achieve partial mineralization of PCM solution [36,37]. EAOPs such as AO, EF and photo electro-Fenton have also been studied for the removal of PCM with poor mineralization efficiency reported for AO with commercial electrodes such as Pt, Ti/SnO₂, Ebonex® and Ti/ IrO₂, whereas excellent mineralization (> 80% TOC removal) was achieved with BDD anode and Fenton-based EAOPs [19,35,38-40].

In this paper, we investigated the electrochemical oxidation potential of sub-stoichiometric TiO₂ for degradation and mineralization of acidic solution of PCM in different electrolyte media. The TiO₂ electrode was prepared by reduction of commercial TiO₂ in an electric arc furnace, followed by high temperature (10 000 – 15 000 °C) plasma deposition on Ti-alloy substrate. The structural properties of this electrode has been reported elsewhere [20]. This production technique is cost-efficient because plasma technology is a widely accepted technique for coating large surface, up to 1 m² or even more, thus economical for commercial production than CVD used in BDD anode production. The influence of the EAOPs types (i.e. AO with H₂O₂ generation (AO-H₂O₂) and EF) and current on the degradation kinetics of PCM and mineralization rate of its aqueous solution was carefully examined. For comparison, similar studies were performed with commercial DSA and BDD anodes. The generated short-chain carboxylic acids, the inorganic ions released in the treated solution and the aromatic intermediate formed during the electrochemical oxidation of PCM in sulfate medium were identified and/or quantified and a plausible reaction sequence for complete mineralization of PCM by hydroxyl radicals was proposed.

2. Experimental procedures

2.1. Chemicals

Reagent grade PCM (C₈H₈NO₂ – purity > 98%) was purchased from Sigma-Aldrich and used without further purification. Anhydrous sodium sulfate (Na₂SO₄), sodium chloride (NaCl), sodium nitrate (NaNO₃) and sodium chloride (NaClO₃) used as supporting electrolyte were of reagent grade supplied by Merck and Acros Organics. All the solutions were prepared with high-purity water obtained from a Millipore Milli-Q system with resistivity > 18 MΩ cm at a room temperature (23 ± 2°C). Organic solvents and other chemicals used were either of HPLC or analytical grade purchased from Merck, Fluka and Sigma-Aldrich.

2.2. Electrochemical cell

All electrolyses were performed in an open and undivided cylindrical reactor of 250 mL capacity in which the aqueous solutions of PCM were placed. Three electrodes, all with 24 cm² (4 cm × 6 cm) surface area, were used as anode: Ti₄O₇ (thin film deposited on Ti alloy from Saint-Gobain CREE, France), commercial DSA (a mixed metal oxide Ti/ RuO₂-IrO₂ from Baoji Xinyu GuangjiDian Limited Liability Company, China) and BDD (thin-film deposited on a niobium substrate from CONDIALS, Germany). The cathode was a tri-dimensional, large surface area carbon-felt (14 cm × 5 cm × 0.5 cm (in width)), from Carbone-Lorrain, France.

In all trials, the anode was centered in the electrochemical cell and surrounded by the cathode (carbon-felt), covering the inner wall of the cell. H₂O₂ was continuously generated in situ by 2 e⁻ reduction of dissolved O₂ at the carbon felt cathode. The concentration of O₂ in the solution was maintained constant by continuously bubbling compressed air via a silica frit at about 1 L min⁻¹, starting 10 min prior to electrolyses. All trials were performed with 230 mL aqueous solutions of 0.2 mM PCM (corresponding to 19.2 mg L⁻¹ TOC) in 0.05 M Na₂SO₄ or 0.1 M NaCl, NaNO₃ or NaClO₃ as supporting electrolyte, at room temperature (23 ± 2°C).

2.3. Instrument and analytical procedures

The electrolyses were performed with a Hameg HM8040 triple power supply at constant current. A CyberScan pH 1500 pH-meter (Eutech Instruments) was employed to measure solution pH. The mineralization of the treated solutions were analyzed from the decay of the dissolved organic carbon, which can be considered as the total organic carbon (TOC) in the case of highly water-soluble organic compounds like PCM. A Shimadzu VSHC TOC analyzer was used to determine TOC in accordance with the thermal catalytic oxidation principle. Reproducible TOC values, within ± 2% accuracy were found using the non-purgeable organic carbon method. The values obtained were used to estimate the mineralization current efficiency according to Eq. (6):

\[\text{MCE}(\%) = \frac{\Delta \text{TOC}_{\text{exp}}}{\text{F} \times \text{I} \times \text{t}} \times 100 \]  (6)

where (ΔTOC)ₜₚₑₜ is the TOC decay at time t, F is the Faraday constant.
prior to electrolysis. Aromatic intermediates formed during AO-HCl of PCM was achieved successfully regardless of the anode material or medium used during both AO-HCl and EF treatment, indicating the excellent potential of these two EAOPs for effective decontamination of water polluted by PCM. In SO\(_4^{2-}\) medium (Fig. 1a), the slowest degradation rate was observed with DSA anode during AO-HCl, which requires over 1 Ah L\(^{-1}\) charge for complete disappearance of PCM in the solution. On the contrary, lower charge (~0.5 Ah L\(^{-1}\)) was required for complete oxidation of PCM when TiO\(_2\) or BDD anode was used at similar experimental conditions in AO-HCl. The faster degradation observed with both TiO\(_2\) and BDD anodes compared to DSA anode can be explained by the high O\(_2\)-evolution over-potential of both TiO\(_2\) and BDD anodes, allowing the production of large quantities of physisorbed TiO\(_2\)(OH) or BDD'(OH), which led to the effective degradation of the organics compared to DSA'(OH). Due to the strong interaction between the anode surface and 'OH, the formed radicals at the surface of active anodes like DSA are mainly chemisorbed and be- as relatively weak oxidant compared to physisorbed TiO\(_2\)(OH) or BDD'(OH). Additionally, there is possibility of production of peroxisulfate (SO\(_4^{2-}\)) ions in the sulfate medium [35,44,45] with non-active anodes, especially BDD anode, which is a relatively strong oxidant with longer life-span compared to hydroxyl radicals, thus enhancing the degradation of PCM. The formation of SO\(_4^{2-}\) from SO\(_4^{2-}\) during the electrochemical treatment in sulfate medium especially at high current has been reported by several authors and can simply be explained by Eq. (9) [46]. However, other studies have shown that the formation of SO\(_4^{2-}\) from SO\(_4^{2-}\) is major by M'(OH)/OH oxidation of the latter as shown in Eq. (10) [47]. In this case, part of the M' (OH)/OH produced at the surface of BDD/TiO\(_2\) anodes and in the bulk are trapped by an oxidizable species like sulfate to form the corresponding peroxides. At the end, several oxidizing agents could be involved in the mediated oxidizing process because the decomposition of peroxisulfate gives hydrogen peroxide and other oxidants [44].

\[
2\text{SO}_4^{2-} \rightarrow \text{S}_2\text{O}_8^{2-} + 2e^- \tag{9}
\]

\[
2\text{HSO}_4^- + 2\text{OH}^- \rightarrow \text{S}_2\text{O}_8^{2-} + 2\text{H}_2\text{O} \tag{10}
\]

As shown in Fig. 1a, faster degradation of PCM was observed with EF compared to AO-HCl in all media studied. This is expected because of large quantities of homogeneous 'OH produced in the bulk of the solution from Fenton’s reaction (Eq. (2)). Thus PCM molecules are destroyed both in bulk of solution by homogeneous 'OH and at surface of anode by heterogeneous M'(OH) allowing quick oxidation of PCM.

Degradation efficiency results obtained with typical inert anions such as NO\(_3^-\) and ClO\(_4^-\) (Fig. 1b and 1c respectively) were quite similar and inferior to those obtained in SO\(_4^{2-}\) for each electrode under analogous experimental conditions. For instance, complete degradation of PCM was achieved after 2 Ah L\(^{-1}\) of applied charge under AO-HCl condition in either of NO\(_3^-\) or ClO\(_4^-\) electrolyte with DSA, TiO\(_2\) or BDD anode compared to 1 Ah L\(^{-1}\) required in SO\(_4^{2-}\) for TiO\(_2\) and BDD anodes. Since the electrolyses were performed in an inert electrolyte, the faster degradation efficiency observed with BDD anode compared to TiO\(_2\) and DSA anodes showed the superior potential of the former for the production of large quantities of BDD'(OH). Additionally the slower degradation of PCM observed in these inert electrolytes (NO\(_3^-\) and ClO\(_4^-\)) compared to sulfate electrolyte during AO-HCl suggest the formation and participation of SO\(_4^{2-}\) and sulfate radicals as a weak oxidants in degradation of the pharmaceutical in sulfate medium. As expected, faster degradation was observed under EF treatment condition compared to AO-HCl in either NO\(_3^-\) or ClO\(_4^-\) medium with complete removal of PCM attained just after 0.52 Ah L\(^{-1}\) of charge with all anode materials. Again in EF, removal efficiency of PCM was much better in sulfate medium compared to either NO\(_3^-\) or ClO\(_4^-\), indicating that sulfate is a much better supporting electrolyte in electrochemical wastewater treatment.

In contrast, electrolyses in Cl\(^-\) medium (Fig. 1d) exhibited different behavior with both AO-HCl and EF oxidation, achieving complete degradation of PCM within the first 0.52 and 0.35 Ah L\(^{-1}\) of applied charge, respectively, owing to the high contribution of active chlorine species generated from Eqs. (3–5) in the cell, to the overall oxidation of PCM. In both cases of AO-HCl and EF, faster degradation of PCM was observed in Cl\(^-\) medium compared to the other active electrolyte (SO\(_4^{2-}\)) or inert medium like NO\(_3^-\) and ClO\(_4^-\). The advantage of

\[
\text{CaH}_2\text{NO}_3 + 14\text{H}_2\text{O} \rightarrow 8\text{CO}_2 + \text{NH}_4^+ + 33\text{H}^+ + 34e^- \tag{7}
\]
electrochemical degradation of organics in Cl⁻ over SO₄²⁻ medium has
been previously observed in several studies. For example, Malpass et al.
[11] reported significant mineralization rate of atrazine in NaCl elec-
trolyte using DSA anode owing to production of ClO⁻ as an active
chlorine species, whereas negligible TOC removal were observed with
other electrolytes like Na₂SO₄, NaOH, NaClO₄ or NaNO₃. Excellent
degradation efficiency was also reported for electrooxidation of 17β-
estriadiol (E2) using BDD anode with complete degradation of
500 μg dm⁻³ E2 attained after 5 min of electrolysis in NaCl compared to
40 min required in Na₂SO₄ at current density of 25 mA cm⁻² [44].
Other authors have also shown the benefits of Cl⁻ over SO₄²⁻ for AO-
H₂O₂ degradation of azo dyes Ponceau 4R [41], reactive red 141, Direct
Black 22 and Disperse Orange 29 [48] with BDD anode. Contrary to the
results obtained in other media, much better removal efficiency was
obtained with DSA compared to Ti₃O₇/BDD and BDD anodes in Cl⁻ medium,
both during AO-H₂O₂ and EF treatment (Fig. 1d), owing to its high
potential for the production of active chlorine species. Indeed, DSA
anode has been shown to be more efficient electrode for the produc-
tion of active chlorine species compared to non-active anode like BDD [5].
Furthermore, Bagastyo et al. [49] reported formation of more quantities
of active chlorine species with DSA anode compared to BDD anodes
during the electrochemical oxidation of reverse osmosis concentrate in
0.05 M NaCl. As such, the faster removal efficiency of PCM observed
with DSA anode compared to Ti₃O₇ or BDD anode during the electro-
lysis in Cl⁻ medium in this study can be explained by the formation of
more active chlorine species with this anode. Moreover, the slower
degradation rate observed with Ti₃O₇ and BDD could be attributed to
scavenging action of Cl⁻, which consumed the generated Ti₃O₇/BDD
(OH) and thus slowing the oxidation reaction.

The effect of current on the degradation efficiency of PCM during
treatment with AO-H₂O₂ and EF using Ti₃O₇ anode can be seen in
Fig. 2. Complete degradation of PCM solution was achieved at all cur-
rent studied regardless of electrochemical process applied, while lower
amounts of charges were consumed at lower current (Fig. 2a).
As expected, an increase in current enhanced the removal efficiency of PCM
with electrolysis time (Fig. 2b), thanks to the concomitant production of
more quantities of hydroxyl radicals at the surface of the anode (AO-
H₂O₂) and in the bulk (EF) (owing to more charge supplied) which can
quickly oxidize PCM molecules. Moreover, faster degradation was
achieved by EF compared to AO-H₂O₂ at all current studied, indicating
the superiority of EF compared to AO-H₂O₂ at similar experimental
conditions.

3.2. Mineralization (TOC removal) efficiency of PCM solutions

Fig. 3 showed the corresponding TOC removal efficiency with ap-
plied charge for all the trial shown in Fig. 1. While complete oxidation
of PCM was achieved in all trials, mixed results were obtained for mi-
neralization of the solutions. Poor mineralization of PCM solutions were
observed in all AO-H₂O₂ treatment with DSA anode regardless of the
supporting electrolyte media, whereas relative good or excellent mi-
neralization of the solutions was obtained with Ti₃O₇ and BDD anodes
Fig. 2. Effect of current on oxidative degradation efficiency vs (a) charge supplied and (b) electrolysis time for the degradation of 230 mL of 30.2 mg L$^{-1}$ (0.2 mM) PCM solutions in 0.05 M Na$_2$SO$_4$ at pH 3 using Ti$_4$O$_7$ anode. Treatment: (□) AO – 60 mA, (○) AO – 120 mA, (△) AO – 300 mA, (■) EF – 60 mA, (●) EF – 120 mA and (▲) EF – 300 mA.

Fig. 3. TOC removal efficiency vs electrolysis time for the mineralization of 230 mL of 30.2 mg L$^{-1}$ (19.2 mg L$^{-1}$ TOC) PCM solutions in (a) 0.05 M Na$_2$SO$_4$, (b) 0.1 M NaNO$_3$, (c) 0.1 M NaClO$_4$ and (d) 0.1 M NaCl at 120 mA constant current intensity and pH 3. Treatment: (□) AO – DSA, (○) AO – Ti$_4$O$_7$, (△) AO – BDD, (■) EF – DSA, (●) EF – Ti$_4$O$_7$ and (▲) EF – BDD.
The mineralization efficiency for trials in SO₄²⁻ with different anode materials is shown in Fig. 3a. Firstly, it can be seen that for each anode material, EF treatment leads to faster and higher TOC removal efficiency compared to corresponding AO-H₂O₂ experiments. As explained in Section 3.1, this was attributed to concomitant generations of hydroxyl radicals both at the surface of the anode and in the bulk, as well as reduced diffusion distance between the pollutant and the 'OH produced in the bulk. As such, in all electrolyte media studied, the mineralization efficiency approximately follows this order: AO-H₂O₂ < DSA < AO-H₂O₂ – Ti₇O₇ < EF – DSA < EF – Ti₄O₇ ≤ AO-H₂O₂ – BDD < EF – BDD. The poor and slow TOC removal efficiency achieved in AO-H₂O₂ with DSA (~50%) after 4.17 Ah L⁻¹ at 8 h) is due to its low oxidation power, since DSA('OH) generated at its surface is readily converted to chemisorbed species which is much less reactive and can only achieve degradation of parent molecule without destroying efficiently the intermediate byproducts [5]. Upon substituting DSA with either Ti₄O₇ or BDD in AO-H₂O₂, a remarkable acceleration in TOC removal was achieved with excellent mineralization efficiency up to 81% and 93%, respectively, obtained after 4.17 Ah L⁻¹ charges (8 h of electrolysis). Such enhancement can be explained by the greater ability of high oxidation power anodes such as Ti₄O₇ or BDD to produce loosely adsorbed Ti₄O₇('OH)/BDD('OH) which are powerful oxidants that can easily mineralize both PCM and its organic intermediates compared to a low oxidation power anode like DSA [4,50,51]. On the other hand, EF treatment with DSA attained much better mineralization efficiency (79% after 4.17 Ah L⁻¹ charge) compared to AO-H₂O₂, thanks to the production of large quantities of 'OH in the bulk from Fenton’s reaction (Eq. (2). The homogeneous 'OH effectively oxidize both PCM and its primary intermediates but less effective in mineralization of refractory final by-products, which accounts for the large residual TOC content (~21%) in the final solution after treatment. Besides, almost complete mineralization (90 and 95% after 4.17 Ah L⁻¹ charges) was attained with Ti₄O₇ and BDD, respectively, during EF, suggesting a beneficial effect of these anodes for the destruction of refractory organic by-products such as carboxylic acids. Indeed, studies have shown that physisorbed hydroxyl radicals (M('OH) such as Ti₄O₇('OH) or BDD('OH) are more effective than free 'OH produced in the bulk in mineralization of short-chain carboxylic acids or their complexes with ferric iron ions, which are usually the final end-products in EF treatment [52,53].

The mineralization efficiency results obtained for treatment in ClO₄⁻²⁻ and NO₃⁻ were quite similar as shown in Fig. 3b and 3c, but slightly lower compared to what was obtained in SO₄²⁻ medium in agreement with degradation efficiency results. As explained in Section

Fig. 4. Effect of applied current vs (a) charge and (b) electrolysis time on TOC removal efficiency and (c) corresponding mineralization current efficiency vs charge, obtained during the mineralization of 230 mL of 30.2 mg L⁻¹ (19.2 mg L⁻¹ TOC) PCM solutions in 0.05 M Na₂SO₄ at pH 3 using Ti₄O₇ anode. Treatments: (□) AO – 60 mA, (▲) AO – 120 mA, (▲) AO – 300 mA, (■) EF – 60 mA, (●) EF – 120 mA and (▲) EF – 300 mA.
3.1, the slight enhancement of mineralization efficiency observed in SO₄²⁻ compared to ClO₄⁻ and NO₃⁻ confirmed the contribution of S₂O₅²⁻ and sulfate radicals formed in SO₄²⁻ medium to the mineralization of PCM and its organic intermediates. In contrast to the faster PCM concentration decay found in Cl⁻ medium (Section 3.1), a detrimental effect on mineralization efficiency was observed compared to other media (Fig. 3d). In Cl⁻ medium, a very poor mineralization was observed with all anode materials in AO-H₂O₂ with final TOC removal efficiency of 11%, 27% and 49%, respectively, for DSA, Ti₃O₇ and BDD anodes. The poor TOC removal efficiency was explained by the partial consumption of heterogeneous hydroxyl radicals by Cl⁻ to produce less oxidizing species (Eq. (11)).

\[
\text{M}^{+}(\text{OH}) + \text{Cl}^- \rightarrow \text{M} + 1/2 \text{Cl}_2 + \text{OH}^- \tag{11}
\]

\[
\text{H}_2\text{O}_2 + \text{HClO} \rightarrow \text{Cl}^- + \text{O}_2\text{Cl} + \text{H}_2\text{O} + \text{H}^+ \tag{12}
\]

Moreover, slightly better mineralization efficiency was attained in EF treatment with the TOC removal efficiency rises to 53%, 61% and 63% for DSA, Ti₃O₇ and BDD anodes, respectively. Again, after 4.17 Ah L⁻¹ charges (8 h of electrolysis) in EF treatment, the TOC removal efficiency in Cl⁻ was significantly lower (53%-63%) compared to other media (76%-95%). This behavior can be attributed to four phenomena: (i) the scavenging effect of Cl⁻ (Eq. (11)) which reduces the contribution of physisorbed radicals to the mineralization of organics, (ii) destruction of the electrogenerated H₂O₂ by active chlorine species (Eq. (12)) which attenuate the Fenton's reaction (Eq. (2)), (iii) depletion of Fe²⁺ in the bulk due to formation of Fe(III)-carboxylic acid complexes and (iv) formation of highly refractory chloro-derivatives [41,54].

The effect of applied current on TOC removal efficiency vs charge for trial conducted in SO₄²⁻ medium using Ti₃O₇ anode is shown in Fig. 4a. As can be observed, enhanced TOC removal efficiency was observed with increased charge consumed (i.e. high current) in both AO-H₂O₂ and EF processes. For instance, the TOC removal efficiency after 8 h of electrolysis at 2.1, 4.2 and 10.4 Ah L⁻¹ charges consumed (i.e. 60, 120 and 300 mA) under AO-H₂O₂ condition was 69%, 81% and 89%, respectively, indicating progressive improvement in mineralization efficiency with rise in current. Similar trend was observed in EF treatment with TOC removal efficiency attained 77%, 90% and 94% at 2.1, 4.2 and 10.4 Ah L⁻¹ charges consumed, respectively. This is more explicit in Fig. 4b (TOC removal vs electrolysis time) as higher current always led to better TOC removal at all electrolysis time during both AO-H₂O₂ and EF treatment. The greater amount of Ti₃O₇(·OH)

---

**Fig. 5.** Evolution of chlorinated ions: (a) Cl⁻, (b) ClO⁻, (c) ClO₂⁻ and (d) ClO₄⁻ accumulated during the electrolysis of 230 mL of 10 mM NaCl at pH 3 and 120 mA using (a) AO – DSA, (b) AO – Ti₃O₇, (c) AO – BDD and (d) EF – Ti₃O₇.
produced from anodic oxidation of water and the faster electro-generation of \( \text{H}_2\text{O}_2 \) and regeneration of \( \text{Fe}^{2+} \) at higher current accounted for such acceleration of TOC removal [43,55]. However, the enhancement attained when increasing the current from 120 to 300 mA was less remarkable compared to that observed when increasing from 60 to 120 mA (Fig. 4b), suggesting reduction in oxidation ability of the processes due to progressive enhancement of parasitic reactions that consume the generated hydroxyl radicals without contributing efficiently to the mineralization of organics [56]. The mineralization current efficiency (MCE) obtained for each trial of Fig. 4a is given in Fig. 4c. As can be observed, a lower applied current led to a higher MCE at any time compared to higher current, which means that the ratio of organic pollutants to the generated hydroxyl radicals was very high at lower current, thus promoting the oxidation of organics and reducing the effect of parasitic reactions or the self-destruction of the oxidant species.

3.3. Evolution of active chlorine species

The evolution of chlorinated ions during the application of AO-H\(_2\)O\(_2\) and EF in the presence of Cl\(^-\) ion was investigated. Typical trials were conducted with a solution containing 10 mM NaCl at pH 3 and 120 mA current using DSA, Ti\(_4\)O\(_7\) or BDD anode with 0.1 mM \( \text{Fe}^{2+} \) in the case of EF process. As can been seen in Fig. 5, Cl\(^-\) ion was gradually disappearing from the solution via direct electrochemical oxidation (Eq. (3)) and M(\text{OH})\(^+\)/OH\(^-\) destruction (Eq. (11)) at the anode and in the bulk, whereas ClO\(^-\) is significantly more accumulated with DSA anode (Fig. 5a) compared to Ti\(_4\)O\(_7\) (Fig. 5b) or BDD (Fig. 5c) anodes. This can be attributed to higher oxidation power of Ti\(_4\)O\(_7\) and BDD anode in which ClO\(^-\) is quickly oxidized to ClO\(_3^-\) and ClO\(_4^-\) (Fig. 5b and c). It is important to state that ClO\(_3^-\) is the highest accumulated chlorine species in all case with quite similar and higher concentration (1–1.6 mM) for Ti\(_4\)O\(_7\) and BDD anodes, whereas much lower quantities (0.17 mM) was attained with DSA anode. Again, ClO\(_4^-\) was more accumulated with BDD than Ti\(_4\)O\(_7\), whereas its accumulation is lowest with DSA anode. Interestingly accumulation-destruction profiles were

---

![Fig. 6](image_url)  
Evolution of main aromatic intermediates (a) hydroquinone (HQ) and (b) benzoquinone (BQ) during the degradation of 230 mL of 30.2 mg L\(^{-1}\) (0.2 mM) PCM solutions in 0.05 M Na\(_2\)SO\(_4\) at pH 3 using Ti\(_4\)O\(_7\) anode. Treatment: (□) AO – 60 mA, (△) AO – 120 mA, (▲) AO – 300 mA, (■) EF – 60 mA, (●) EF – 120 mA and (▲) EF – 300 mA.

![Fig. 7](image_url)  
(a) Evolution of short-chain carboxylic acids: (■) oxalic, (●) oxamic, (▲) maleic, (□) acetic and (▲) glyoxylic and (b) inorganic ions: (●) NH\(_4^+\) and (■) NO\(_3^-\) during the mineralization of 230 mL of 30.2 mg L\(^{-1}\) (19.2 mg L\(^{-1}\) TOC) PCM solutions in 0.05 M Na\(_2\)SO\(_4\) at pH 3 and applied current of 120 mA using Ti\(_4\)O\(_7\) anode.
obtained for ClO$^-$ and ClO$_4^-$ with both Ti$_4$O$_7$ and BDD anodes, whereas continuous accumulation with plateau was observed with DSA anode. The higher ClO$^-$ observed with DSA anode (Fig. 5a) could explain the faster degradation of PCM obtained with DSA anode compared to Ti$_4$O$_7$ and BDD anodes in Cl$^-$ medium as reported in Fig. 1d, since ClO$^-$ is a better oxidant compared to ClO$_3^-$ and ClO$_4^-$.

Moreover, similar trend was observed during EF oxidation with Ti$_4$O$_7$ anode (Fig. 5d) however, with lower accumulation of ClO$^-$, ClO$_3^-$ and ClO$_4^-$ and slower decay of Cl$^-$ compared to AO-H$_2$O$_2$ with the same anode. The lower quantity of ClO$^-$ observed in all cases could be as a result of the initial pH of the solutions (pH $\sim$ 3) since HClO formation rather than ClO$^-$ is favored at strong acidic pH.

### 3.4. Evolution of oxidation by-products and reaction pathways

The kinetics and mineralization studies previously discussed have been accompanied by the identification of aromatic intermediates, carboxylic acids and inorganic ions. Two cyclic/aromatic intermediates were detected and quantified during the degradation of PCM. Based on previous study [36,37] and by injecting standard solutions in reversed phase HPLC using similar conditions as that of PCM, the two intermediates were confirmed to be hydroquinone ($t_R = 5.2$ min) and benzoquinone ($t_R = 9.5$ min) and their evolution with time are shown in Fig. 6a and 6b. It can be seen that the by-products are formed right from the beginning of electrolyses, which corresponds to the oxidation of PCM. In all trials, a typical accumulation-destruction cycle was observed for both intermediate products at all currents studied, thanks to greater formation from the PCM destruction at the early stage of electrolysis, followed by the predominant oxidation/degradation by the large quantities of hydroxyl radicals generated as treatment time increases. As in the case of PCM oxidation (Fig. 2), the degradation rate of both byproducts increased when the applied current was raised, thus complete disappearance of both byproducts was achieved in very short time at the highest current in both AO-H$_2$O$_2$ and EF treatment. Maximum concentration of 4.8 mg L$^{-1}$ and 4.4 mg L$^{-1}$ were attained for hydroquinone and benzoquinone, respectively. It is important to note that hydroquinone was more accumulated in AO-H$_2$O$_2$, whereas the formation of benzoquinone was prominent during EF treatment.

Further degradation of these aromatic by-products yielded several short-chain carboxylic acids as shown by ion-exclusion HPLC analysis. The chromatograms always showed the presence of oxalic acid ($t_R = 8.6$ min), maleic acid ($t_R = 10.6$ min), oxamic acid ($t_R = 12.7$ min), acetic acid ($t_R = 14.2$ min) and glyoxylic acid ($t_R = 17.1$ min), mostly formed at the early stage of the electrolysis. As shown in Fig. 7a, a cycle of accumulation –destruction was observed, thanks to the faster transformation of the primary aromatics intermediates into short-chain carboxylic acids at early stage, and destruction at much longer treatment time. Oxalic acid was the most persistent and highest accumulated with maximum concentration of 0.14 mM in agreement with previous reports [52,53]. The presence of non-mineralized carboxylic acids after 4.17 Ah L$^{-1}$ (8 h of electrolysis) as presented in Fig. 7a can be accounted for the residual TOC (Fig. 4a) of

![Fig. 8. Proposed reaction pathways based on identified by-products for complete mineralization of PCM by hydroxyl radicals.](image-url)
The authors thank the ANR (French National Research Agency) funding through ANR ECS – CIElectron project, (grant no: ANR-13-ECOT-0003).

Appendix A. Supplementary material

Supplementary data associated with this article can be found in the online version, at https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seppur.2018.03.076.

References


