Selective Adsorption of Sulfur Dioxide in a Robust Metal-Organic Framework Material

To cite this version:

HAL Id: hal-01573030
https://hal.archives-ouvertes.fr/hal-01573030
Submitted on 8 Aug 2017

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L’archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire HAL, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d’enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.
Selective Adsorption of Sulfur Dioxide in a Robust Metal–Organic Framework Material


There is ever-increasing concern over global air quality, with high concentrations of smog posing significant health risks worldwide, particularly in major cities with heavy industry and high population densities. The World Health Organization (WHO) suggests that poor air quality is directly responsible for one eighth of total global deaths.[1] The problem posed by smog is particularly pronounced in Asia, where it is responsible for over 500 000 premature deaths every year.[2] Smog is comprised primarily of hydrocarbons, particulates, and oxides of nitrogen and sulfur, which are emitted as byproducts of combustion in both transportation and industrial applications. Emissions of sulfur dioxide (SO₂) from industrial applications are increased by the burning of coal and lower-grade oil, which have a high concentrations of sulfur.[3] Selective removal of SO₂ from the combustion flue gas is therefore of fundamental importance to the improvement of air quality.

Typical flue gas generated by the combustion of pulverized coal can contain 10–12% CO₂, 500–3000 ppm SO₂, and 10–40 ppm NO₂.[4] The majority of the SO₂ present in the flue gas (~95%) can be removed by processes such as scrubbing with limestone slurry or the via the wet sulfuric acid process.[5] Although these industrial processes have high efficiency and cost effective, they are not able to remove all traces of SO₂. Residual SO₂ in post-combustion flue gas can react with organic amines in the CO₂ scrubbing process, causing permanent loss of amine activity and decreasing the efficiency of this process. Emissions of SO₂ following all post combustion processing can be as high as 400 ppm, which when vented to the atmosphere is 50 000 times higher than the WHO recommendation of 8 ppb, and therefore poses a significant health risk.[6] Complete removal of traces of SO₂ is challenging since it requires capture systems possessing exceptionally high selectivity of SO₂ over N₂ and CO₂ and simultaneously considerable stability given the highly corrosive and reactive nature of SO₂.[7]

Reversible physiosorption within porous materials provides a promising approach for selective gas removal. Constructed from organic ligands and metal ions, metal–organic framework (MOF) materials have been studied widely for gas adsorption over the past decade owing to their high internal surface area and porosity.[8] The highly modular nature of these framework solids allows the design of materials tuned with specific functional groups and/or open metal sites for specific binding to guest molecules within the pore. For this reason, MOFs have shown great promise in applications such as gas adsorption, storage, and separation, substrate binding, and drug delivery.[9] Within the field of gas adsorption, major research interest has been focused on using MOFs for high capacity storage of hydrogen and methane, and for the separation of CO₂ and small molecule hydrocarbons.[9a,10,11] However, in contrast, studies on adsorption of SO₂ in MOFs have been very rarely reported[12]
due to the limited stability of coordination compounds to highly reactive SO\textsubscript{2}; this is particularly the case for MOFs with open metal sites and this has precluded the study of adsorption of this important pollutant. Herein, we report the selective SO\textsubscript{2} adsorption in an ultra-robust MOF material [MFM-300(In)] with high adsorption capacity of SO\textsubscript{2} (8.28 mmol g\textsuperscript{-1} at 298 K and 1 bar) and, more importantly, exceptionally high selectivity of SO\textsubscript{2}/CO\textsubscript{2} (60), SO\textsubscript{2}/CH\textsubscript{4} (425), and SO\textsubscript{2}/N\textsubscript{2} (5000) under ambient conditions (i.e., 50:50 mixture at 1 bar and 298 K). The material can be readily regenerated post-adsorption without incurring any noticeable framework degradation. We also report the direct observation and quantification of adsorbed SO\textsubscript{2}, CO\textsubscript{2}, and N\textsubscript{2} molecules in the pore of this material in order to understand this unusually high selectivity. The nature of the host–guest binding interactions have been systematically studied by a combination of in situ single-crystal and powder X-ray diffraction, infrared microspectroscopy and inelastic neutron scattering (INS) experiments, coupled with computational modeling. These complementary techniques give consistent results confirming that adsorbed SO\textsubscript{2} forms specific multiple supramolecular interactions with the free hydroxyl groups and aromatic rings on the pore surface of this material, with significantly weakened interactions in the case of CO\textsubscript{2} and N\textsubscript{2} adsorption, thus rationalizing the observed selectivities at a molecular level.

The complex MFM-300(In) (MFM = Manchester Framework Material replacing the previous NOTT (Nottingham) designation) \textbf{[In\textsubscript{2}(OH)\textsubscript{2}(L)] (H\textsubscript{4}L = biphenyl-3,3',5,5'-tetracarboxylic acid)} was synthesized by solvothermal reaction of In(NO\textsubscript{3})\textsubscript{3} and H\textsubscript{4}L in DMF (N,N-dimethylformamide) at 90 °C.\textsuperscript{[11]} MFM-300(In) is isostructural to MFM-300(Al)\textsuperscript{[12a]} and MFM-300(Ga),\textsuperscript{[13]} and comprises chains of corner sharing [InO\textsubscript{4}(OH)\textsubscript{2}] octahedra linked by mutually cis-µ\textsubscript{2}-OH groups, and further bridged by tetracarboxylate L\textsuperscript{4−} ligands. This arrangement generates a highly porous material, defined by one-dimensional pore channels bounded by In-OH-In groups and ligand phenyl rings in a “wine rack” array. Desolvated MFM-300(In) displays a Brunauer–Emmett–Teller (BET) surface area of 1071 m\textsuperscript{2} g\textsuperscript{-1}, a pore size of ≈7.5 Å, and a total pore volume of 0.419 cc g\textsuperscript{-1} as determined from N\textsubscript{2} isotherm at 77 K. Desolvated MFM-300(In) shows a very high concentration of functional groups in the pore; there are approximately two hydroxyl groups per 100 Å\textsuperscript{2} internal surface area.

Adsorption of N\textsubscript{2}, CO\textsubscript{2}, and SO\textsubscript{2} as single component gases in MFM-300(In) exhibit reversible type-I isotherms over a wide temperature range between 298 and 348 K (Figure 1a,b and Figure S10–S14, Supporting Information) with significantly different adsorption capacities. At all temperatures, the adsorption of SO\textsubscript{2} is strongly favored within this material. At 298 K, MFM-300(In) shows a steep SO\textsubscript{2} adsorption profile between 0 and 50 mbar leading to an uptake of 5.90 mmol g\textsuperscript{-1} accounting for 71% of the maximum uptake of 8.28 mmol g\textsuperscript{-1} recorded at 1 bar. In contrast, the uptake of CO\textsubscript{2} and N\textsubscript{2} in MFM-300(In) are recorded as 3.61 and 0.25 mmol g\textsuperscript{-1}, respectively, at 298 K and 1 bar. Importantly, the low pressure region of the CO\textsubscript{2} isotherm shows a much lower adsorption uptake (0.18 mmol g\textsuperscript{-1} at 50 mbar) than that of SO\textsubscript{2} uptake (5.90 mmol g\textsuperscript{-1}), while the uptake of N\textsubscript{2} is negligible (<0.05 mmol g\textsuperscript{-1}) under the same conditions, confirming the high affinity of MFM-300(In) to SO\textsubscript{2}.

Figure 1. View of a) N\textsubscript{2}, CO\textsubscript{2}, and SO\textsubscript{2} adsorption isotherms of MFM-300(In) to a pressure of 1 bar at 298 K; b) SO\textsubscript{2} adsorption isotherms of MFM-300(In) between 298 and 348 K; c,d) isosteric heat and entropy of adsorption for N\textsubscript{2}, CO\textsubscript{2}, and SO\textsubscript{2} in MFM-300(In); e) IAST selectivity of SO\textsubscript{2}/N\textsubscript{2} and SO\textsubscript{2}/CO\textsubscript{2} mixtures in MFM-300(In) to a pressure of 1 bar at 298 K.
Under the same conditions, the uptake of CH$_4$ in MFM-300(In) is also low (Figure S17, Supporting Information). Adsorption of SO$_2$ in MFM-300(In) reduces steadily as the temperature increases from 298 to 348 K, consistent with the nature of physisorption. Nevertheless, at 348 K, a high SO$_2$ uptake of 6.78 mmol g$^{-1}$ was recorded in MFM-300(In) at 1 bar. At 298 K and 1 bar, the SO$_2$ uptake of MFM-300(In) (8.28 mmol g$^{-1}$) is higher than that of MFM-300(Al) (7.1 mmol g$^{-1}$), but lower than that of MFM-202a (10.2 mmol g$^{-1}$), which has a much higher surface area of 2220 m$^2$ g$^{-1}$. However, adsorption of SO$_2$ in MFM-202a triggers an irreversible framework phase transition in addition to a shallower adsorption profile in the low pressure region in comparison to that of MFM-300(In). The SO$_2$ adsorption capacity of MFM-300(In) is significantly higher than that reported for other sorbent materials, including the very stable Prussian blue analogues ZnCo and CoCo (1.8 and 2.5 mmol g$^{-1}$ at 1 bar and 298 K, respectively) and other MOF materials such as IRMOF-3, SOF-74, and MOF-5 (6.0, 3.0, and 1.0 mmol g$^{-1}$, respectively) at 298 K and 1 bar.[12b] The isosteric heat ($Q_{st}$) and entropies ($S_{st}$) of adsorption were determined by fitting of the van't Hoff isotherm to the adsorption isotherms of each gas at least 5 temperatures (Figure 1c,d, Figure S15, Supporting Information). In order to accurately compare these values at all surface coverages, high pressure N$_2$ adsorption isotherms were recorded up to 180 bar at ambient temperatures, where a coverage of ca. 5 mmol g$^{-1}$ was reached (Figure S11, Supporting Information). MFM-300(In) shows a low $Q_{ca}$ for N$_2$ of 9.4 kJ mol$^{-1}$ at low surface coverage, rising to 14.6 kJ mol$^{-1}$ at 4.0 mmol g$^{-1}$, significantly lower than that of CO$_2$ with a $Q_{ca}$ of 20.3 kJ mol$^{-1}$ at low loading, rising to 27.2 kJ mol$^{-1}$ at 5 mmol g$^{-1}$. In contrast, the $Q_{ca}$ for SO$_2$ is considerably higher, with a value of 34.5 kJ mol$^{-1}$, increasing to 39.6 kJ mol$^{-1}$ at 5 mmol g$^{-1}$, representing the highest value observed in MOF materials.[12] A steady increase in the isosteric heats of adsorption was observed for all three gases suggesting the presence of strong adsorbate–adsorbate interaction in the pore as the surface coverage increases.

The marked differences in adsorption profiles, uptake capacities, and $Q_{ca}$ between SO$_2$, CO$_2$, CH$_4$, and N$_2$ indicates that MFM-300(In) has the potential to separate mixtures of these gases. To provide further insight into the potential separation capability of this material, ideal adsorbed solution theory (IAST) calculations[14] was carried out for SO$_2$/CO$_2$, SO$_2$/CH$_4$, and SO$_2$/N$_2$ gas mixtures in MFM-300(In) as a function of pressure and over a range of molar compositions (from 5:95 to 50:50), representative of a wide range of potential applications (Figure 1e and Figure S18, Supporting Information). It is important to note that IAST calculations based upon mixtures with ratios below 5:95 give artificially high selectivity values, which are subject to high uncertainties and are therefore not reported here. The selectivity data for SO$_2$/CO$_2$ and SO$_2$/CH$_4$ are between 46-60 and 275-425, respectively, and are relatively constant as a function of pressure and gas stream composition. Crucially, MFM-300(In) shows an extremely high SO$_2$/N$_2$ selectivity of 5000 at 1 bar, representing the highest value observed to date.[12] It is worth noting that IAST calculations often overestimate the selectivity if one adsorbate is strongly favored over another and can only give a theoretical insight into the separation capability of a given material. To overcome this problem, we used isotherm data for N$_2$ up to 180 bar in order to obtain comparable spreading pressure data to that of SO$_2$ and therefore perform reliable IAST calculations. Indeed, we have tried to perform the IAST calculations of SO$_2$/N$_2$ selectivity based upon N$_2$ isotherm up to 1 and 20 bar, where the selectivities were overestimated by ~10x and ~3x (Figure S18, Supporting Information), respectively. The unprecedented selectivity of MFM-300(In) for SO$_2$ confirms its potential as an adsorbent for selective SO$_2$ removal, particularly in applications where low residual SO$_2$ is of prime importance.

Direct observation of adsorbed gas molecules within the MFM-300(In) host material is essential in order to gain a molecular understanding of the high selectivity of this material. In this study, the locations of adsorbed SO$_2$ and CO$_2$ molecules in MFM-300(In) have been determined unambiguously by in situ synchrotron powder or single-crystal X-ray diffraction experiments (Figure 2). Two independent SO$_2$ adsorption sites (SO$_2$ I and SO$_2$ II) were found in SO$_2$-loaded MFM-300(In) at 298 K (Figure 2a–c). Specifically, SO$_2$ I is located near to the bridging hydroxyl group, $[O=O=O^\cdots O=H = 1.17(4) \text{ Å}]$ with full site occupancy; SO$_2$ II is located perpendicularly to SO$_2$ I at $[O=S=O^\cdots O=S=O = 4.52(2) \text{ Å}]$ and parallel within the pore at a distance of 3.92(5) Å from the phenyl rings, again with full site occupancy. The $O=O=S=O^\cdots O=H=S=O^\cdots O=S=O^\cdots O=S=O$ interaction distances within this material were observed to be within the same range as in the pure component crystal structure of SO$_2$ (3.10–4.49 Å),[15] confirming the very efficient packing of SO$_2$ molecules within this material, leading to high storage capacity and density. Indeed, at 298 K and 1 bar the density of adsorbed SO$_2$ in MFM-300(In) was estimated to be 1.27 g cm$^{-3}$, comparable to the liquid SO$_2$ density of 1.46 g cm$^{-3}$ at 263 K and 1 bar. Attempts to locate the adsorbed CO$_2$ molecules in MFM-300(In) at 298 K suffered from serious positional disorder in the refinement, consistent with the low $Q_{ca}$ and hence reduced strength of binding. The location of adsorbed CO$_2$ molecules was therefore determined at 195 K where thermal motion is greatly reduced. Similarly, two independent CO$_2$ adsorption sites (CO$_2$ I and CO$_2$ II) were found in CO$_2$-loaded MFM-300(In) at 195 K (Figure 2d–f). CO$_2$ I was located near to the bridging hydroxyl group $[O=C=O^\cdots O^\cdots O=H = 3.04(1) \text{ Å}]$ in an almost end-on configuration, disordered over a mirror plane intersecting the metal hydroxy bond, with full occupancy; CO$_2$ II was located perpendicularly to CO$_2$ I at $[O=C=O^\cdots O=O^\cdots S=O^\cdots S=O^\cdots S=O^\cdots S=O]$ lying parallel to the pore at a distance of 3.65(3) Å to the phenyl rings, again with full occupancy. The binding distances of the adsorbed CO$_2$ molecules are similar to those observed in solid CO$_2$ (3.10 Å),[16] indicating the high packing efficiency of CO$_2$ at 195 K. These structural modes obtained from in situ diffraction studies are in excellent agreement with those obtained from DFT calculations (Figure 2c,f). This study confirms that the free bridging hydroxyl group within the pore of MFM-300(In) is the preferential binding site for both SO$_2$ and CO$_2$ molecules, followed by a secondary binding site toward the edge of the pore of this material, sitting between the phenyl rings of two discrete ligand molecules, stabilized, in principle, by an intermolecular highly cooperative dipole interaction with adsorbed gas molecules at site I. Attempts to determine the binding site for N$_2$ at 298 K was unsuccessful owing to the extremely low uptake observed in this material.
Understanding the change in dynamics upon the binding of gas (SO$_2$, CO$_2$, and N$_2$) within these materials can provide fundamental insights into the multiple supramolecular binding modes (e.g., hydrogen bond, intermolecular dipole) of the adsorbed gas molecules and therefore can give insight into the selectivity. INS is a spectroscopic technique which is particularly sensitive to the dynamics of hydrogen atoms, with signals overwhelming all other modes, and is used here to investigate the vibrational motions of the host–guest systems.\[10e, 12a,17\] INS spectra of bare and the N$_2$, CO$_2$, and SO$_2$ loaded materials (2 gas molecules per In for each gas) were collected at 10 K (Figure 3a–c), in addition to DFT calculations of the INS spectra of these structural models, which were found to be in excellent agreement with the experimental data (Figure 3d,e). INS spectra of the bare material show three distinct low-energy peaks at 13, 22, and 31 meV (group I) relating to the lattice modes of the material; additional groups of peaks were observed at 40–70 meV (group II) and 70–167 meV (group III) and were assigned to wagging/bending modes of the bridging hydroxyl group and of the aromatic C–H bonds from the phenyl rings, respectively. On addition of N$_2$, peaks in groups I, II, and III remain essentially unchanged, indicating that there is negligible distortion of the local modes of the MOF material and of the O–H or C–H wagging modes, consistent with the extremely low binding energy and adsorption properties. Addition of CO$_2$ is accompanied by significant broadening to peaks in group I, indicating a wide range of changes to the lattice dynamic modes of the material (more stiffening) as a result of CO$_2$ inclusion. This is further accompanied by shifts in the peaks of group II and III, confirming that the adsorbed CO$_2$ molecules are strongly interacting with the bridging hydroxyl and C–H groups. The addition of SO$_2$ results in even further broadening of the lattice modes, commensurate with the increased rigidity of the overall framework. The positions of peaks of group II and III shift more dramatically on addition of SO$_2$ than CO$_2$, with marked changes in the difference spectra. The changes upon addition of SO$_2$ indicate that the adsorbed SO$_2$ molecules are interacting with the bridging hydroxyl group in a much stronger fashion than that of CO$_2$. Interestingly, to the best of our knowledge, this represents the first example of direct observation and quantification of the host–guest binding strength via analysis of lattice dynamics in MOFs. These results confirm the changes in the host–guest dynamics upon gas binding in MFM-300(In) and thus the observed selectivities for gas separation.

In order to further investigate effects of pure component and mixed gas adsorption on the vibrational modes of this material, an in situ synchrotron micro-IR spectroscopic study\[18\] was carried out with single crystals of MFM-300(In) upon loading of SO$_2$, CO$_2$, and a SO$_2$/CO$_2$ mixture (Figure 3f–i). In particular, comparison of the change of $\nu$(µ$_2$-OH) modes in the presence of SO$_2$ and CO$_2$ can provide a unique insight into the strength of the binding and competition between these two components within MFM-300(In). Upon desolvation of MFM-300(In) under a He flow, a broad band centered at $\approx$3550 cm$^{-1}$ (corresponding to adsorbed water) was completely removed, revealing a distinct absorption band at 3657 cm$^{-1}$ corresponding to the $\nu$(OH) stretching mode. Upon dosing the desolvated material with up to 1 bar of CO$_2$, this peak shifts by five wavenumbers from 3657 to 3652 cm$^{-1}$, indicating a partial depletion of bare –OH groups within this material, consistent with formation of the –OH–O=–C=O binding interaction, as observed in the crystallographic study. The associated combination bands of

![Figure 2. View of the position of adsorbed SO$_2$ molecules within MFM-300(In) as determined by a,b) single-crystal X-ray diffraction; c) DFT calculations. View of position of adsorbed CO$_2$ molecules within MFM-300(In) as determined by d,e) powder X-ray diffraction; f) DFT calculations. The O=X=O$^\cdot$–O–H bond lengths are shown in green; O=X=O$^\cdot$–H–phenyl bond lengths are shown in purple; O=X=O$^\cdot$–X=O$^\cdot$ bond lengths are shown in blue; O=X=O$^\cdot$–pore wall bond lengths are shown in cyan.](image-url)
adsorbed CO$_2$ appear at $\approx 3590$ and 3695 cm$^{-1}$ and appear in the same ratio as that of the $\nu(\text{OH})$ band at 3657 cm$^{-1}$, consistent with the sharp adsorption profile of SO$_2$ at this pressure and indicating that this binding site is being rapidly occupied. Depletion of the band corresponding to the $\nu(\text{OH})$ stretching mode of the bare material is accompanied by the emergence of a new band at 3637 cm$^{-1}$, a 20 cm$^{-1}$ red shift from the original band, indicating a significant change to the $\nu(\text{OH})$ mode upon SO$_2$ binding. Indeed, upon additional loading of SO$_2$ from 0.01 to 1 bar, a second new band grows in steeply at 3617 cm$^{-1}$ with concomitant loss of the original bare $\nu(\text{OH})$ band and gradual decrease of the $\nu(\text{OH}\ldots \text{O})$ band shifted $\approx 40$ cm$^{-1}$ lower energy than the original bare $\nu(\text{OH})$ band. At 1 bar CO$_2$, the peak areas of the $\nu(\text{OH})$ bands corresponding to the bare and CO$_2$-loaded material are approximately equal, as observed in the pure CO$_2$ loading experiment. Upon dosing the CO$_2$-loaded material with SO$_2$ in a stepwise manner (i.e., tuning the SO$_2$/CO$_2$ mixture composition from 0/100 to 100/0 while maintaining a total pressure of 1 bar), there is a steady change in the $\nu(\text{OH})$ region that includes new bands appearing in a similar manner to those observed in the pure SO$_2$ experiment, indicating that the bound CO$_2$ does not...
Impede the adsorption of SO₂. In other words, SO₂ in the gas phase can readily displace the bound CO₂ in the pore as a result of the stronger binding strength of this gas. Fitting the v(OH) bands determined in the pure component experiment reveals a very rapid depletion of the v(OH) band corresponding to the bare material, reaching 0 by a SO₂ partial pressure of 0.02 bar, and a more gradual decrease of the v(OH) band corresponding to the CO₂-occupied sites, reaching 0 at a SO₂ partial pressure of 0.25 bar. This is accompanied by concurrent increases in the SO₂-bound v(OH) bands at both 3637 and 3617 cm⁻¹. At a SO₂ partial pressure of 0.10 bar, the band at 3637 cm⁻¹ reaches its maximum intensity, indicating saturation of SO₂ at site I. The bands determined in the pure component experiment reveals the exceptionally high selectivity of this material for SO₂ capture in both dry and humid conditions. In conclusion, selective SO₂ adsorption has been realized in MFM-300(In), a material which exhibits exceptionally high SO₂/CO₂ (60), SO₂/CH₄ (425), SO₂/N₂ (5000) selectivity under ambient conditions. Importantly, MFM-300(In) displays complete retention of the framework structure upon contact with SO₂, H₂SO₃, and H₂SO₄ (Figure S1–S9, Supporting Information), demonstrating the excellent stability and applicability of this material for SO₂ capture in both dry and humid conditions. This is rare for a MOF material and especially so for an In(III) system. A combination of crystallographic and spectroscopic techniques have been applied to investigate the origin of the observed selectivity of this material, revealing that differences in the strength of multiple supramolecular binding interactions with the pore surface are directly responsible for the different binding affinity to a number of gases. Thus, high selectivity for SO₂, excellent stability and facile regeneration post-adsorption are all achieved in MFM-300(In).

**Experimental Section**

*In Situ Synchrotron X-Ray Diffraction: High-resolution X-ray powder diffraction of SO₂ and CO₂ loaded MFM-300(In) was carried out at 0.82612(6) Å on beamline 111 of the Diamond Light Source and at 0.495891(2) Å on beamline ID31 at the European Synchrotron Radiation Facility, respectively. Single-crystal X-ray diffraction of desolvated and CO₂-loaded MFM-300 (In) was carried out at beamline 119 of the Diamond Light Source. The experiments were carried out using a custom gas cell and handling equipment. The desolvated material was generated in situ by heating the sample to 423 K under reduced pressure (10⁻⁷ mbar) (2 h for powdered sample, 20 h for single crystal). The samples were cooled to 298 K before being dosed with the analyte gas and in the case of CO₂, further cooled to 195 K before the diffraction data were measured. The locations of the gas molecules could be discerned from the Fourier difference maps at 298 K for SO₂ and 195 K for CO₂ and were included in the refinement model with bond distances and angles constrained to ideal values.*

**Supporting Information**

Supporting Information is available from the Wiley Online Library or from the author.

**Acknowledgements**

The authors thank the Universities of Manchester and Nottingham for funding. M.S. acknowledges receipt of funding from EPSRC (EP/...
1011870; EP/(2013)869) and ERC Advanced Grant (AdG 226593). The authors also thank Dr. C. Muyn and Dr. J. Waters for their assistance in collecting SEM (Scanning Electron Microscopy) images. The authors are especially grateful to STFC and the ISIS Neutron & Muon Source for access to the TOSCA spectrometer; to Diamond Light Source for access to beamline 11.19, and 822, to the European Synchrotron Radiation Facility for access to Beamline ID31 and to ORNL for access to VISION. Computing resources were made available through the VirtualE (Virtual Experiments in Spectroscopy) project, funded by Laboratory Directed Research and Development program (LDRD 7739) at the Oak Ridge National Laboratory.

Received: May 2, 2016
Revised: June 3, 2016
Published online: August 16, 2016