Increases in soil organic carbon sequestration can reduce the global warming potential of long-term liming to permanent grassland

Dario Fornara, Sibylle Steinbeiss, Niall Mcnamara, Gerd Gleixner, Simon Oakley, Paul Poulton, Andrew Macdonald, Richard D Bardgett

To cite this version:


HAL Id: hal-00599529
https://hal.archives-ouvertes.fr/hal-00599529
Submitted on 10 Jun 2011

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L’archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire HAL, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d’enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.
**Increases in soil organic carbon sequestration can reduce the global warming potential of long-term liming to permanent grassland**

**Journal:** Global Change Biology  
**Manuscript ID:** GCB-10-0540  
**Wiley - Manuscript type:** Primary Research Articles  
**Date Submitted by the Author:** 30-Jun-2010  

**Complete List of Authors:**  
Fornara, Dario; University of Ulster, Environmental Sciences  
Steinbeiss, Sibylle; Institute of Groundwater Ecology, Helmholtz Centre Munich  
McNamara, Niall; CEH  
Gleixner, Gerd; Max-Planck-Institute for Biogeochemistry  
Oakley, Simon; CEH  
Poulton, Paul; Department of Soil Science, Rothamsted Research  
MacDonald, Andrew; Department of Soil Science, Rothamsted Research  
Bardgett, Richard D; Soil and Ecosystem Ecology Laboratory, Lancaster Environment Centre

**Keywords:** agro-ecosystems, climate change mitigation, legumes, nitrogen fertilizer, soil density fractionation, soil microbial community

**Abstract:** The application of calcium- and magnesium-rich materials to soil, known as liming, has long been a foundation of many agro-ecosystems worldwide because of its role in counteracting soil acidity. Although liming contributes to increased rates of respiration from soil thereby potentially reducing soils ability to act as a CO2 sink, the long-term effects of liming on soil organic carbon (Corg) sequestration are largely unknown. Here, using data spanning 129 years of the Park Grass Experiment at Rothamsted (UK), we show net Corg sequestration measured in the 0-23 cm layer at different time intervals since 1876 was 2 to 20 times greater in limed than in unlimed soils. The main cause of this large Corg accrual was greater biological activity in limed soils, which despite increasing soil respiration rates, led to plant C inputs being processed and incorporated into resistant soil organo-mineral pools. Limed organo-mineral soils showed: (1) greater Corg content for similar plant productivity levels (i.e. hay yields); (2) higher 14C incorporation after 1950s atomic-bomb-testing; and (3) lower C:N ratios than unlimed organo-mineral soils, which also indicate higher microbial
processing of plant C. Our results show that greater Corg sequestration in limed soils strongly reduced the global warming potential (GWP) of long-term liming to permanent grassland suggesting the net contribution of agricultural liming to global warming could be lower than previously estimated. Our study demonstrates that liming might prove to be an effective mitigation strategy, especially because liming applications can be associated with a reduced use of nitrogen fertilizer which is a key cause for increased greenhouse gas emissions from agro-ecosystems.
Increases in soil organic carbon sequestration can reduce the global warming potential of long-term liming to permanent grassland

**Running title:** Liming effects on soil carbon sequestration

**Authors:** D. A. Fornara¹,², S. Steinbeiss³, N. P. McNamara⁴, G. Gleixner⁵, S. Oakley⁴, P. R. Poulton⁶, A. J. Macdonald⁶, and R. D. Bardgett²

¹ Environmental Sciences Research Institute, University of Ulster, Coleraine, BT52 1SA, UK

² Soil and Ecosystem Ecology Laboratory, Lancaster Environment Centre, Lancaster University, Lancaster LA1 4YQ, UK

³ Institute of Groundwater Ecology, Helmholtz Centre Munich, 85764 Neuherberg, Germany

⁴ Centre for Ecology and Hydrology, Lancaster Environment Centre, Library Avenue, Bailrigg, Lancaster, LA1 4AP

⁵ Max-Planck-Institute for Biogeochemistry, 100164 – 07701 Jena, Germany

⁶ Department of Soil Science, Rothamsted Research, Harpenden, AL5 2JQ, UK

**Corresponding author:** D.A. Fornara, Environmental Sciences Research Institute, University of Ulster, Coleraine BT52 1SA, UK

Email: d.fornara@ulster.ac.uk; Phone: +44 (0) 28 70324658; Fax: +44 (0) 2870 324911

**Key words:** agro-ecosystems; climate change mitigation; legumes; nitrogen fertilizer; Park Grass Experiment; soil density fractionation; soil microbial community
Abstract

The application of calcium- and magnesium-rich materials to soil, known as liming, has long been a foundation of many agro-ecosystems worldwide because of its role in counteracting soil acidity. Although liming contributes to increased rates of respiration from soil thereby potentially reducing soils ability to act as a CO₂ sink, the long-term effects of liming on soil organic carbon (C_{org}) sequestration are largely unknown. Here, using data spanning 129 years of the Park Grass Experiment at Rothamsted (UK), we show net C_{org} sequestration measured in the 0-23 cm layer at different time intervals since 1876 was 2 to 20 times greater in limed than in unlimed soils. The main cause of this large C_{org} accrual was greater biological activity in limed soils, which despite increasing soil respiration rates, led to plant C inputs being processed and incorporated into resistant soil organo-mineral pools. Limed organo-mineral soils showed: (1) greater C_{org} content for similar plant productivity levels (i.e. hay yields); (2) higher ^{14}C incorporation after 1950s atomic-bomb-testing; and (3) lower C:N ratios than unlimed organo-mineral soils, which also indicate higher microbial processing of plant C. Our results show that greater C_{org} sequestration in limed soils strongly reduced the global warming potential (GWP) of long-term liming to permanent grassland suggesting the net contribution of agricultural liming to global warming could be lower than previously estimated. Our study demonstrates that liming might prove to be an effective mitigation strategy, especially because liming applications can be associated with a reduced use of nitrogen fertilizer which is a key cause for increased greenhouse gas emissions from agro-ecosystems.
Introduction

Global warming mitigation requires an effective strategy portfolio which includes reduction in CO₂ emissions, but also increased CO₂ sequestration in long-lived pools, such as world soils (Lal, 2004; Six et al., 2004). Agricultural soils in particular have the potential to act as C sinks following changes in land-use from arable cropping to long-term grasslands, or after the introduction of no-tillage systems, and changes to lime and fertilizer inputs (Lal, 2004; Six et al., 2004; West & McBride, 2005; Hamilton et al., 2007; Biasi et al., 2008). The application of calcium- and magnesium-rich materials to soil (liming), has long been a common agricultural practice worldwide, because it counteracts soil acidity and helps sustain and improve plant growth (Edmeades & Ridley, 1998; Norton & Chang, 2003). Lime applications are estimated to be ~ 30 Tg y⁻¹ in the US alone (Hamilton et al., 2007) and globally are expected to increase threefold in the next 50 years due to the expansion of intensive agricultural practices (Tilman et al., 2001).

Emissions of CO₂ from lime are currently calculated with the mass fraction of C (12%) in either limestone (CaCO₃) or dolomite (MgCa(CO₃)₂) assuming an emission factor of 100%, whereby all C in lime is released into the atmosphere (IPCC, 1997, 2006). Liming is expected to increase soil C losses, mainly because of lime-induced increases in soil biological activity and therefore rates of soil CO₂ respiration (Zelles et al., 1987; Badalucco et al., 1992; Brady & Weil 2002; Biasi et al., 2008). Recent studies, however, suggest at least two potential pathways through which lime could enhance CO₂ sink capacity of agricultural soils. First, lime dissolution could increase carbonic acid (HCO₃⁻) concentrations in soil water solutions which could sequester 25-50% of lime C
in moderately acid soils (Hamilton *et al.*, 2007). Second, long-term liming and fertilization treatments may contribute to redistribute $C_{\text{org}}$ from labile to more humified soil pools which are resistant to decomposition (Manna *et al.*, 2007). This may occur through positive calcium (Ca)-induced effects on soil aggregate stability (Grant *et al.*, 1992) and on the physical protection of soil $C_{\text{org}}$ (Clough & Skjemstad, 2000), which ultimately contribute to enhanced soil organic matter stabilization (Morris *et al.*, 2007).

Despite the evidence of positive lime-induced effects on the soil $C_{\text{org}}$ pool, no studies have yet quantified the effects of long-term liming on net changes in $C_{\text{org}}$ sequestration in humified soils. Such data is essential to estimate the net contribution of liming to soil C dynamics and to quantify the global warming potential (GWP) of liming in agro-ecosystems. In particular, it is important to know how different agricultural practices contribute to net greenhouse gas emissions if we are to fully understand their impact at the global scale (Robertson *et al.*, 2000; Smith *et al.*, 2008).

Here we examine long-term data collected from the Park Grass Continuous Hay Experiment at Rothamsted (UK). Park Grass was established in 1856 (Lawes & Gilbert, 1859) and is the oldest ungrazed permanent grassland experiment the world. The data was used to: (1) determine whether long-term liming has influenced net changes in soil $C_{\text{org}}$ sequestration across experimental plots which have received four different long-term fertilization treatments (see Methods); (2) examine aboveground-belowground interactions that could influence long-term lime-induced effects on soil $C_{\text{org}}$ sequestration; (3) estimate the global warming potential (GWP) of agricultural liming on the basis of its impact on changes in soil $C_{\text{org}}$ sequestration and $CO_2$ fluxes associated with liming and fertilization treatments on the Park Grass Experiment.
Methods

Experimental design and data

The Park Grass Experiment is located at Rothamsted, Harpenden, Hertfordshire, in the south-east of England (51°48'N and 0°22'W). It was established in 1856 on 2.8 ha of land that had been permanent pasture for at least 100 years (Lawes & Gilbert 1900; Richardson, 1938; Thurston et al., 1976). Four plots with contrasting fertilizer treatments (see Table 3 in Supporting Information 1), whose effects on soil properties and plant community composition had been documented since the beginning of the experiment (Richardson, 1938; Thurston et al., 1976; Sohi et al., 2001; Crawley et al., 2005; Hopkins et al., 2009), were selected for this study. The whole experiment received a small amount of lime in the 1880s; 4.0 tCaCO$_3$ ha$^{-1}$ on the plots chosen for this study. A test of liming started on half-plots in 1903 (1920 on plot 14) with 4.0 tCaCO$_3$ ha$^{-1}$ applied every four years. A new liming scheme was introduced in 1965; depending on the fertilizer treatment different amounts of lime were applied with the aim of maintaining soil pH at 7 in one of four quarter-plots within each treatment, whilst one sub-plot remained unlimed (see Table 3 in Supporting Information 1). By 2005 soil pH values of sub-plots given the largest lime dressings within plots 7, 14, 9 and 3 were 7.0, 7.0, 7.2 and 7.3 respectively, whereas pH values of the corresponding unlimed sub-plots were: 4.9, 6.1, 3.6 and 5.3. The lack of treatment replication in the Park Grass Experiment (see also Data analysis) was overcome to some extent by using soil samples (0-23 cm) taken from the same treatments over an extended period of time. In particular, measurements of soil carbon were done on archived soil samples collected in 1870, 1876, 1959, 1971, 1976, 1984, 1991, 1998, 2002 and 2005. Soils for 1971 and 1976 were available only for limed and
unlimed plots respectively (Table 3 in Supporting Information 1). The unlimed sub-plot
given (NH$_4$)$_2$SO$_4$ (plot 9) has developed through time a thick mat of undecomposed
vegetation which was kept separate when soil sampling (i.e. we sampled within c. 3-23
cm of mineral soil). Soil C values for 1932 were taken from literature (Richardson, 1938)
and were measured in soil samples collected to a depth of 20 cm. Because some soils
were ground (e.g. in 1959) they could not be used for density fraction analyses. We used
soil weights measured in 1876 and 1959 to estimate tonnes of organic C per hectare
which did not change substantially between 1959 and 2005 (Hopkins et al., 2009).

Finally, we used long-term data of plant aboveground productivity (i.e. hay
yields) which are available from the online Electronic Rothamsted Archive (ERA:
http://www.rothamsted.bbsrc.ac.uk/eRA/).

Soil organic matter fractionation

In 1870 and 1876, soils were sampled with an open-ended metal box (30 x 30 x 23cm
deep); one hole was sampled in 1870 and three in 1876. In later years, 15 to 20 soil cores
were taken with a 2 or 3cm diameter auger from each sub-plot and bulked together.
Archived soils from different years (Table 3 in Supporting Information 1) were sieved to
remove roots, dried at 40 °C for 5 days and stored in glass vials. We separated soil
organic matter fractions by floatation and sedimentation using a sodium iodide (NaI)
solution at a density of 1.80 g cm$^{-3}$ following a detailed protocol (Sohi et al., 2001; see

This method distinguishes between: (a) a free-organo-mineral fraction (FR-SOM) at
density < 1.80 g cm$^{-3}$ which represents discrete free organic particles located between
stable soil aggregates; (b) an intra-aggregate organo-mineral fraction (IA-SOM) also at density < 1.80 g cm\(^{-3}\) which represents discrete organic particles located within stable soil aggregates; and (c) a residual heavy organo-mineral fraction at densities > 1.80 g cm\(^{-3}\) which is considered more recalcitrant than the FR-SOM and IA-SOM fractions (Sohi et al., 2001). Both soil bulk samples and soil fractions were analyzed for total C and N by combustion and gas chromatography (COSTECH Analytical ECS 4010 instrument). To determine organic C concentration, bulk soil subsamples were burned for 16 hours at 550 °C in a muffle furnace. Organic carbon was then calculated as the difference between total soil C and inorganic C measured in the residue ashes after furnace burning (we repeated the same procedure using organo-mineral soil fractions). Total C in soils sampled in 2002 was determined by measuring CO\(_2\) produced following high temperature oxidation using a LECO CNS-2000 elemental analyser.

**Soil respiration analyses**

Sixteen soil samples (6 cm diameter 10 cm depth) were randomly collected in each of the 8 sub-plots in 2008 stored in cooler box for 6 hours and then in a fridge at 4°C for one day. Four soil samples from each sub-plot were then allocated to each of four controlled environment rooms operated at 4, 10, 15 and 20°C. Soil CO\(_2\) flux measurements were made using a static chamber approach where each core was sealed in a gas tight incubation chamber (1.8 L) with a rubber septa in the lid and 8 ml gas samples were taken at 0, 60, 120 and 240 minutes after chamber closure. Samples were stored in Exetainer gas vials (Labco Ltd, UK) and CO\(_2\) concentrations were analysed using a Perkin Elmer Autosystem XL Gas Chromatograph fitted with a flame ionisation detector.
and methaniser. Results were calibrated against a certified gas standard comprising 541 ppm CO₂ (BOC, UK). CO₂ fluxes rates per gram dry weight of soil were calculated using a standard approach (Holland et al., 1999) after applying linear regression to the CO₂ concentrations versus time data for each replicate.

The Q₁₀ values were then calculated from an exponential model fitted to the CO₂ flux data for the four incubation temperatures. The Q₁₀ is the proportional increase in respiration as the temperature increases by 10°C where the Q₁₀ = (R₂/R₁)^10/(T₂-T₁) with R₁ and R₂ being the respiration rates at two given temperatures (T₁, T₂) separated by 10°C.

Microbial analyses

Phospholipid fatty acid (PLFA) analysis was used to gain insight into the effects of fertilization and liming treatments on microbial community composition. Four fresh soil samples were collected in June 2008 from each subplot 0-10 cm soil depth, stored in a cooler box for 16 hours, and freeze-dried. Microbial lipids were extracted from 2 g of each freeze-dried soil with a solvent system that included methanol, chloroform, and a phosphate buffer. Total extracted lipids collected in the organic phase were fractionated into neutral, glyco-, and polar lipids with chloroform, acetone, and methanol using silicic acid chromatography. We used i15:0, a15:0, i16:0, i17:0 and a17:0 PLFAs as indicative of Gram + bacteria whereas 16:1ω7, 16:1ω9, 16:1ω5 and 18:1ω7 PFLAs were indicative of Gram – bacteria (Frostegård et al., 1993; Pawlett et al., 2000; Kramer & Gleixner, 2006).
Radiocarbon measurements were performed at the Max-Planck-Institute for Biogeochemistry in Jena, Germany. Samples were weighed into tin capsules and combusted by an elemental analyzer. The evolved CO\textsubscript{2} was transferred into a glass tube cooled with liquid nitrogen containing the iron catalyst necessary for reduction. The CO\textsubscript{2} was reduced to graphite at 600°C with an excess of hydrogen gas. The resulting graphite was analyzed by \(^{14}\)C AMS. We dated the organo-mineral soil fraction only because this is a large and relatively stable soil carbon pool, and is likely to give reliable information on the potential accumulation of \(^{14}\)C after nuclear bombs testing in the 1950s.

**Global Warming Potential (GWP) of agricultural liming**

We estimated the global warming potential (GWP) for each fertilization and liming treatments applied to the Park Grass plots between 1984 and 2005 based on contributions of individual gases (CO\textsubscript{2}, CH\textsubscript{4} and N\textsubscript{2}O-N; see Supporting Information 2). GWP gives an estimate of the cumulative radiative forcing of individual greenhouse gases relative to some reference gas, usually CO\textsubscript{2}, over a specific time span, here 21 years (see also Robertson et al., 2000). We estimated the net CO\textsubscript{2} fluxes taking into account: (1) net soil CO\textsubscript{2} changes between 1984 and 2005; (2) liming contribution to GWP through increased soil CO\textsubscript{2} emissions using IPCC factors (IPCC, 1997, 2006); (3) liming contributions to GWP due to the production and transport of lime; (4) GWP associated with the production and transport of fertilizers; (5) GWP associated with the emissions of N\textsubscript{2}O and CH\textsubscript{4} from soil; and (6) GWP associated with machinery emissions during field operations (i.e. liming, fertilization and hay cutting activities; see Supporting Information 2).
Data analysis

The Park Grass Experiment was designed before modern statistical ideas about replication and randomization had been developed (Crawley et al., 2005). However, the size of the experimental plots (>100 m$^2$) and the number of soil samples collected within each plot (15 to 20), together with the repeated samplings over time, go some way to compensate for the lack of replication, particularly because this grassland was reasonably uniform before the experiment began (Lawes & Gilbert, 1859). Our main goal was to address whether and why net changes in soil C$_{org}$ sequestration might occur across years depending on different liming and fertilization treatments rather than to compare the total soil C$_{org}$ content of different experimental plots. To determine potential liming and fertilization effects on soil C$_{org}$ sequestration across years we used repeated measures MANOVA. The distribution of soil C and N values for each year met the preconditions of a normal distribution ($\alpha = 0.01$, $p > 0.55$ for multiple Shapiro-Wilk tests).

Linear and multiple regression analyses were performed to address potential relationships between different soil and plant variables. To quantify how soil C$_{org}$ content of the organo-mineral fraction changed in limed and unlimed plots between 1984 and 2005 under different fertilization treatments, we calculated the annual rate of change in C$_{org}$ ($r$). To do this, we used the C$_{org}$ content of each sub-plot in 1984 and in 2005, with $r$ being:

$$ r = \log_e[(C_{org\ 1984}/C_{org\ 2005})/t], $$

where $t$, time, is 21 years. This gives, for each sub-plot, the rate of change in the C$_{org}$ content of the organo-mineral fraction with units of yr$^{-1}$. 
Results

Soil $C_{\text{org}}$ sequestration

We found that the $C_{\text{org}}$ sequestration to 23 cm soil depth since 1876, and averaged across the four different fertilization treatments, was significantly greater in limed than in unlimed soils (MANOVA, $F_{1,6} = 10.8$, $P = 0.015$; Fig. 1a). In particular, the net $C_{\text{org}}$ increase in limed soils since 1876 was 2 times and 20 times greater in 1932 and 1991 than in unlimed soils, respectively. Also, the total $C_{\text{org}}$ content of limed soils, averaged for four recent years (i.e., 1991, 1998, 2002 and 2005), was $16.2 \pm 2.2$ t ha$^{-1}$ greater than in unlimed soils.

Soils that have not received lime (except for the small amount applied in the 1880s) show no significant changes in $C_{\text{org}}$ sequestration between 1876 and 2005 ($P = 0.34$, Fig. 1a). We found the increased $C_{\text{org}}$ content of limed soils was mainly due to increases in $C_{\text{org}}$ in the organo-mineral soil fraction ($F_{1,5} = 29.9$, $P = 0.002$; Fig. 1b). Liming however did not affect the $C_{\text{org}}$ content of more labile soil fractions (Table 1; Table 4 in Supporting Information 1). Increased soil $C_{\text{org}}$ sequestration in the limed plots occurred while air temperatures at Rothamsted also increased $>1.0 \, ^{\circ}\text{C}$ between 1876 and 2005 (Fig. 1b).

Soil $C_{\text{org}}$ and aboveground plant productivity

We tested whether soil $C_{\text{org}}$ accrual could result from greater plant productivity in limed grasslands (i.e. increased C inputs to limed soils). Aboveground plant biomass (averaged for 25 years; see Fig. 4c in Supporting Information 1) was significantly higher ($P < 0.0001$) in limed ($6.1 \pm 0.4$ t ha$^{-1}$) than unlimed plots ($4.9 \pm 0.3$ t ha$^{-1}$), and was
significantly lower (P < 0.0001) in unfertilized (3.2 ± 0.1 t ha⁻¹) than fertilized plots (6.3 ± 0.2 t ha⁻¹; see Fig. 4d in Supporting Information 1). However, we could not detect any significant relationship between plant aboveground productivity and total soil C_{org} in our plots (F₁,₂₂ = 0.21, P = 0.65), or between plant productivity and net changes in soil C_{org} between 1984 and 2005 (F₁,₇ = 2.08, P = 0.2). Instead, we found that for similar hay yields across years, the organo-mineral fraction of limed soils had ~137% more C_{org} than the same fraction of unlimed soils (see Fig. 5 in Supporting Information 1). We also found that in both unlimed and limed plots fertilized with PKNaMg (but not N) the rates of soil C_{org} accrual since 1984 increased significantly (P < 0.04) with the proportion of legume biomass measured in a previous study (Crawley et al., 2005).

To identify potential belowground mechanisms responsible for increased C_{org} in limed organo-mineral soils, we performed a linear regression which included soil pH as predictor variable. This analysis (R² = 0.6, F₁,₄₀ = 19.3, P < 0.0001) shows that the C_{org} of the organo-mineral soil pool strongly increased with soil pH (Fig. 2a). We did not find any significant fertilization treatment effect on total soil C_{org} of the organo-mineral pool (ANOVA, F₃,₄₀ = 0.77, P > 0.51). Also we could not find any significant fertilization effect on soil C_{org} of the organo-mineral pool across years (MANOVA, F₃,₄ = 0.12, P = 0.94 ). However, we found that rates of soil C_{org} change in the organo-mineral pool between 1984 and 2005 were 5.4 times greater in limed than unlimed plots under the (NH₄)₂SO₄ treatment (see blue bars in the small bars plot framed in Fig. 2a), and 9.2 times greater in unfertilized limed soils (red bars).
Changes in soil microbial community composition and soil respiration rates

We tested whether potential liming and fertilization effects on soil C$_{\text{org}}$ content were associated with changes in soil biology. We did not find any difference in microbial biomass between limed and unlimed soils ($F_{1,7} = 0.0008, P = 0.97$), but we found that soil pH exerted a strong negative effect on the ratio of Gram positive to Gram negative bacteria ($G^+:G^-; P < 0.0001$; Fig. 2b). Lower $G^+:G^-$ ratios were associated with a higher temperature sensitivity of soil respiration ($Q_{10}$) (Estimate = -0.78, t-ratio = -11.3, $P < 0.0001$), with greater soil respiration rates, and with higher microbial metabolic quotients (a measure of the microbial respiration per unit biomass; see Table 5 in Supporting Information 1). Liming also had positive significant effects on soil respiration rates at room temperatures of soil incubation of 20°C ($F_{1,30} = 5.9, P = 0.02$), but not at incubation temperatures of 4°C, 10°C or 15°C. Finally, low $G^+:G^-$ ratios in limed plots were associated with greater soil C$_{\text{org}}$ of the organo mineral fraction (Fig. 6 in Supporting Information 1).

Radiocarbon measurements and C:N ratios of the organo-mineral fraction

We found that $^{14}$C incorporation (expressed as percent of modern C (pMC)) into organo-mineral fractions after atomic bomb-testing in the 1950s was significantly higher in limed soils ($R^2 = 0.48, F_{1,22} = 19.1, P = 0.0003$; Fig. 3a). We also found that the C:N ratio of organo-mineral limed soils was negatively associated with pMC ($R^2 = 0.64, F_{1,22} = 37.5, P < 0.0001$; Fig. 3b) suggesting a faster incorporation of C into the organo-mineral fraction of limed soils. In support of this idea (that more C has been processed and
incorporated into organo-mineral soils) we found that limed organo-mineral soils had lower C:N ratios that those of unlimed soils ($R^2 = 0.40$, $F_{1,22} = 14.2$, $P = 0.001$).

**GWP associated with liming and fertilization treatments**

We found that limed plots all exhibited a net GWP which was lower than that of unlimed plots (Table 2). The negative GWP of limed plots means higher mitigation potential of greenhouse gases by permanent grasslands that receive regular liming applications. The lower GWP of limed grasslands was mainly determined by their high soil $C_{\text{org}}$ sequestration ability (Table 2) which offset the emissions of CO$_2$ from the production, transport and application of lime and fertilizers. Across the unlimed plots the PKNaMg and PKNaMg + (NH$_4$)$_2$SO$_4$ treatments showed a mitigation potential which was, however, lower than the mitigation potential of the respective fertilization treatments under lime applications (Table 2). Finally, unlimed plots receiving no fertilization (Nil, in Table 2) or receiving PKNaMg + NaNO$_3$ showed a higher GWP which was mainly due to loss of soil CO$_2$ (positive values in Table 2) during the 21 years period.

**Discussion**

Overall our results indicate that regular lime applications to permanent grassland not only increased soil pH over time (Fig. 1a), but also increased and maintained the $C_{\text{org}}$ sink capacity of the soil to a greater extent than in unlimed soils. Soils that had never received lime, except for a small amount in the 1880s, show no significant change in $C_{\text{org}}$ sequestration between 1876 and 2005 (see Fig. 1a), which is consistent with a long-term study at Park Grass that did not find any significant change in the $C_{\text{org}}$ content of unlimed
soils between 1959 and 2002 (Hopkins et al., 2009). The positive liming-effect on total soil C\textsubscript{org} content was observed as early as 1932 (Richardson, 1938) and 1959 (Thurston et al., 1976) in the same Park Grass plots, however it is the long-term changes in total soil C\textsubscript{org} content revealed in our study that shows the magnitude of the liming effect. In the work reported here, the C\textsubscript{org} sequestration measured in the 0-23 cm layer at different time intervals since 1876 was 2 to 20 times greater in limed than in unlimed soils. Also total C\textsubscript{org} content of limed soils, averaged for 1991, 1998, 2002 and 2005, was 16.2 ± 2.2 t ha\textsuperscript{-1} greater than in unlimed soils. It is not clear what caused the low C\textsubscript{org} content of limed soils measured in 1984 (Fig. 1a), although this could be partly related to the temporary absence of previously regular lime applications in two experimental plots since 1972.

The positive liming effect on net changes in soil C\textsubscript{org} sequestration was observed across different fertilization treatments, and the magnitude of such effect increased at increasing soil pH differences between limed and unlimed plots under the same fertilization treatment. For example, the unlimed grassland fertilized with (NH\textsubscript{4})\textsubscript{2}SO\textsubscript{4} (soil pH = 3.6) has developed a thick ‘mat’ of undecomposed dead plant material which represents a large organic C pool (i.e. ~ 24 t C ha\textsuperscript{-1} as measured in 1959). However, even after adding the C\textsubscript{org} content of this ‘mat’ to the C\textsubscript{org} content of the underlying mineral soil (averaged for 1991, 1998, 2002 and 2005), the overall C\textsubscript{org} content (85 ± 1.3 t C ha\textsuperscript{-1}) was still significantly lower than the C\textsubscript{org} content of limed soils fertilized with (NH\textsubscript{4})\textsubscript{2}SO\textsubscript{4} (103 ± 5.3 t C ha\textsuperscript{-1}; soil pH = 7.2). The question remains, however, about what mechanisms underlie such C\textsubscript{org} accrual in the limed soils of the Park Grass experiment.
Increased C$_{org}$ content of the organo-mineral soil fraction

We found that the increased C$_{org}$ content of limed soils was mainly due to increases in C$_{org}$ in the organo-mineral soil fraction (Fig. 1b), which is considered to be a stable-resistant soil fraction (Sollins et al., 1996; Sohi et al., 2001). Increased soil C$_{org}$ sequestration occurred even though air temperatures at Rothamsted also increased (by > 1.0 °C between 1876 and 2005; Fig. 1b); increases in temperature are known to enhance soil C losses due to enhanced decomposition and soil respiration (Zelles et al., 1987; Badalucco et al., 1992; Biasi et al., 2008; Dorrepaal et al., 2009), and were also detected in this study. Although increased aboveground productivity would be expected to play an important role in enhancing soil C$_{org}$ accrual in limed grasslands through greater C inputs to soil, we did not find evidence to support this in our study. Instead, we found that the organo-mineral fraction of limed soils had ~137% more C$_{org}$ than the same fraction of unlimed soils despite having similar hay yields across years. We also found that rates of soil C$_{org}$ accrual since 1984 increased significantly (P < 0.04) with the proportion of legume biomass in both unlimed and limed plots fertilized with PKNaMg (but not N; see Thurston et al., 1976; Crawley et al., 2005), which suggests that legumes might play a role in soil C accumulation, as previously suggested in both grassland and cropping systems (Drinkwater et al., 1998; Fornara & Tilman, 2008; De Deyn et al., 2009).

Accumulation of C$_{org}$ in limed grasslands could also depend on increased root C inputs to these soils, which is consistent with results of other studies at Park Grass (Jenkinson et al., 2004) which showed that total root mass measured to 23 cm depth in limed soils receiving (NH$_4$)$_2$SO$_4$ was > 2 times greater than that of unlimed soils receiving NaNO$_3$ (9.1 vs 3.3 t ha$^{-1}$ respectively). However, unlimed unfertilized soils also showed high root
mass (9.7 t ha$^{-1}$; Jensen et al., 1997), suggesting other processes (e.g. root C turnover rates, root exudation etc.) might play a significant role in C$_{org}$ sequestration in these grassland soils.

*Changes in soil microbial community and soil respiration rates*

Liming had strong effects on the microbial community composition, resulting in lower G+:G$-$ ratios in limed compared to unlimed plots. Low G+:G$-$ ratios were in turn associated with a higher temperature sensitivity of soil respiration, with greater soil respiration rates and with higher microbial metabolic quotients. This suggests less efficient microbial utilization of C in limed compared to unlimed soils, whereby microbes respire more C per unit of degradable C (see Wardle & Ghani, 1995). These patterns show similarities to soils that have received inputs of easily degradable C or lime (Badalucco et al., 1992; Thirukkumaran et al., 2000), and support the notion that liming increases both the abundance of G$-$ vs. G+ bacteria (Frostegård et al., 1993; Pawlett et al., 2000) and soil microbial activity (Zelles et al., 1987; Badalucco et al., 1992), resulting in higher C losses through soil respiration. If greater soil biological activity is responsible for higher soil respiration rates in our study, albeit measured using soils from a single sampling, it is possible that increased biological activity will also contribute to enhanced incorporation of plant C into more humified soil pools. Indeed, low G+:G$-$ ratios in limed plots were associated with greater soil C$_{org}$ of the organo mineral fraction. A potential mechanism responsible for this may involve the role of G$-$ bacteria which are often root-associated, are largely responsible for the turnover and processing of labile plant material (Kramer & Gleixner, 2006), and can increase their utilization of root exudates in limed
grasslands (Rangel-Castro et al., 2005). Also there is evidence that C-based compounds from the mass of Gram – bacteria after cell death can significantly contribute to SOM formation and stabilization (Kindler et al., 2009).

The idea that more plant C is being processed in limed soils is supported by radiocarbon analyses, which showed higher $1^{14}$C incorporation into organo-mineral fractions of limed than unlimed soils after atomic bomb-testing in the 1950s. As a result of their higher $C_{\text{org}}$ turnover, the C:N ratio of organo-mineral limed soils was also lower than that of unlimed soils and was negatively associated with pMC (see Fig. 3b). Finally, despite limed soils receiving, on average, 2.8 ± 0.3 t C ha$^{-1}$ (from CaCO$_3$) since 1990, we estimated that only 2.7% of this C input remained by 2005. Therefore, although this C input to limed soils contributed to the increase in inorganic C content, the bulk of the C accrual in limed soils was via organic C inputs.

*Global warming potential of long-term liming to permanent grassland*

The increased soil $C_{\text{org}}$ sequestration in limed soils was a key cause of their lower GWP when compared with the GWP of unlimed soils. This means the net contribution of agricultural liming to global warming could be lower than previous estimates suggest (IPCC 1997, 2006). Regular liming applications might prove to be a potential mitigation strategy to global warming if the magnitude of soil $C_{\text{org}}$ accrual we observed in our study is confirmed across a variety of grassland systems (see Soussana et al., 2007). But controls on the use of N fertilizers are also likely to be necessary (Robertson et al., 2000; Smith et al., 2008). Our results indicate that further reductions in the GWP of permanent grassland systems may be achieved by combining the use of lime and PKNaMg fertilizers.
(but not N, see Table 2) to increase the abundance of legumes (Crawley et al., 2005), which may provide the N necessary to sustain productivity and improve soil C sequestration.

Conclusions

Overall, our results show that regular lime applications to long-term grassland enhanced soil organic C sequestration, primarily by increasing the C$_{\text{org}}$ content of a resistant soil organo-mineral pool. Thus, the net contribution of agricultural liming to global warming could be lower than previously estimated (IPCC 1997, 2006) at least for permanent grasslands. More importantly our study highlights two aspects that, if proved general, could affect current predictions on long-term soil C changes in managed grasslands. First, our results show that C sequestration in limed soils was enhanced by elevated soil C turnover rates, and that this was associated with increases in soil pH and changes in soil biological activity. Second, large variations in the organo-mineral C$_{\text{org}}$ content of limed soils over time (see Fig. 1b) raise questions about the long-term stability of these organo-mineral pools. Further studies are required in both of these areas if we are to improve our mechanistic understanding of the key processes controlling C dynamics in grassland soils.

Acknowledgments: This research was supported by a Marie Curie Outgoing Fellowship issued to DAF within the Work Programme 2004, “Structuring the European Research Area” (2002-2006), and based at Lancaster University. We thank Helen Quirk and Gerlinde De Deyn who provided support during the laboratory work at Lancaster
University, and David Tilman for helpful comments on early drafts of the manuscript. We also thank NERC QUEST Thematic Programme for financial support to NPM. Finally, Rothamsted Research is an institute of the Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council and receives support from the Lawes Agricultural Trust.

References


(Palace Leas and Park Grass) have not changed consistently in recent decades.

*Global Change Biology, 15*, 1739-1754.


Lawes JB, Gilbert JH (1900) Agricultural, botanical and chemical results of experiments on mixed herbage of permanent grassland, conducted for many years in succession on the same land. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society Series B – Biological Sciences, 192, 139–210.


Thurston JM, Williams, ED, Johnston AE (1976) Modern developments in an experiment on permanent grassland started in 1856: Effects of fertilisers and lime on


Table 1. Results of density fractionation analyses performed on soil samples collected from the Park Grass plots. Total C and N are expressed both as percentage and as unit weight per kilogram of soil (mean ± S.E.) and averaged for three recent years 1991, 1998 and 2005. FR-SOM = free-aggregate soil fraction; IA-SOM = intra-aggregate soil fraction. “Recovered” indicates the percentage of total C and N recuperated at the end of the density fractionation normalized to the initial mass of soil fractionated.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>C (%)</th>
<th>N (%)</th>
<th>C:N</th>
<th>C (g C kg⁻¹ soil)</th>
<th>N (g N kg⁻¹ soil)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bulk soil</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limed</td>
<td>3.89 ± 0.1</td>
<td>0.31 ± 0.01</td>
<td>12.6</td>
<td>39.2 ± 1.19</td>
<td>3.16 ± 0.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unlimed</td>
<td>3 ± 0.08</td>
<td>0.24 ± 0.008</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>30.1 ± 0.88</td>
<td>2.39 ± 0.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FR-SOM</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limed</td>
<td>7.7 ± 0.84</td>
<td>0.42 ± 0.03</td>
<td>18.3</td>
<td>1.70 ± 0.28</td>
<td>0.09 ± 0.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unlimed</td>
<td>7.5 ± 0.89</td>
<td>0.36 ± 0.01</td>
<td>20.8</td>
<td>1.73 ± 0.24</td>
<td>0.08 ± 0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>IA-SOM</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limed</td>
<td>11.4 ± 0.66</td>
<td>0.47 ± 0.02</td>
<td>24.3</td>
<td>0.59 ± 0.007</td>
<td>0.02 ± 0.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unlimed</td>
<td>12.1 ± 0.59</td>
<td>0.45 ± 0.03</td>
<td>26.8</td>
<td>0.61 ± 0.006</td>
<td>0.02 ± 0.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Organo-mineral</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limed</td>
<td>3.37 ± 0.09</td>
<td>0.29 ± 0.007</td>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>31.2 ± 0.89</td>
<td>2.67 ± 0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unlimed</td>
<td>2.5 ± 0.06</td>
<td>0.20 ± 0.005</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>23.4 ± 0.62</td>
<td>1.91 ± 0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>All fractions</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limed</td>
<td>33.5 ± 1.20</td>
<td>2.78 ± 0.02</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unlimed</td>
<td>25.7 ± 1.02</td>
<td>2.01 ± 0.02</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Recovered (%)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limed</td>
<td>85.4 ± 5.2</td>
<td>87.9 ± 6.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unlimed</td>
<td>85.5 ± 5.9</td>
<td>84.1 ± 5.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2. Relative GWPs for different fertilization and liming treatments based on measurements and estimates of multiple CO₂ sinks and sources (see Supplementary material_2 for details). GWP was estimated for a 21-year period between 1984 and 2005. Negative values indicate a global warming mitigation potential. Units are CO₂ equivalents (g CO₂ m⁻² y⁻¹).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grassland management</th>
<th>CO₂ sinks and sources (g CO₂ m⁻² y⁻¹)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Net soil CO₂ sequestration for 21 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Limed plots</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>-260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PKNaMg</td>
<td>-286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PKNaMg + (NH₄)₂SO₄</td>
<td>-551</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PKNaMg + NaNO₃</td>
<td>-231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Unlimed plots</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>90.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PKNaMg</td>
<td>-84.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PKNaMg + (NH₄)₂SO₄</td>
<td>-64.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PKNaMg + NaNO₃</td>
<td>23.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Fig. 1. (a) Liming effects on bulk soil C$_{org}$ (t C ha$^{-1}$) in the Park Grass Experiment. MANOVA was performed on C$_{org}$ values for 1876, 1932, 1959, 1984, 1991, 1998, 2002 and 2005. Archived soils were also available for limed plots in 1971 and for unlimed plots in 1976. The short vertical bars near the x axis indicate main lime applications (in 1976 lime was applied to only two plots). Solid lines indicate soil pH values for both limed and unlimed plots. (b) Liming effects on C$_{org}$ of the organo-mineral fraction for different years (bar histograms; MANOVA was performed on C$_{org}$ values for 1876, 1984, 1991, 1998 and 2005; also mean increase in annual temperatures (solid line) since 1876 at Rothamsted.

Fig. 2. (a) The relationship between soil C$_{org}$ of the organo-mineral fraction and soil pH (empty circles = unlimed plots, filled circles = limed plots). Different colours indicate different fertilization treatments. The regression analysis included soil C$_{org}$ data for 1876, 1971, 1976, 1984, 1991, 1998 and 2005. The small bars plot framed in the left-upper corner shows the rate of soil C$_{org}$ change for 21 years [Log (soil C 2005/soil C 1984)]/21 of the organo-mineral fraction (filled bars = limed plots; empty bars = unlimed plots within each fertilization treatment). (b) The relationship between Gram+:Gram- bacteria ratio on soil pH as both measured in 2008 (Estimate = - 0.19, t-ratio = -10.8, P < 0.0001).

Fig. 3. (a) The relationship between the percent of modern C (pMC) in the organo-mineral soil fraction and the C$_{org}$ in this fraction (values are for 1984, 1998 and 2005), and (b) on the C:N ratios of the same soil fraction. Filled circles = limed plots; empty circles = unlimed plots. Triangles indicate ‘pre-bomb’ test $^{14}$C measurements on archived soils from 1870, 1876 and 1906 (not included in the regression analysis).
Fig. 1a

![Graph showing bulk soil organic C (g kg⁻¹) vs. soil pH.]

Fig. 1b

![Graph showing soil C (g C kg⁻¹ soil) of the organo-mineral fraction vs. soil pH.]

Fig. 2a

![Graph showing soil C (g C kg⁻¹ soil) of the organo-mineral fraction vs. soil pH.]

Fig. 2b

![Graph showing G + G⁻ ratio vs. soil pH.]

Soil C (g C kg⁻¹ soil) of the organo-mineral fraction vs. soil pH.