
Sergio Rubio, Antonio Chamorro, Francisco Javier Miranda

To cite this version:

HAL Id: hal-00512945
https://hal.archives-ouvertes.fr/hal-00512945
Submitted on 1 Sep 2010

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L’archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire HAL, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d’enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Journal:</th>
<th><em>International Journal of Production Research</em></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Manuscript ID:</td>
<td>TPRS-2006-IJPR-0357.R1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manuscript Type:</td>
<td>Original Manuscript</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date Submitted by the Author:</td>
<td>03-Aug-2006</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Complete List of Authors: | Rubio, Sergio; University of Extremadura, School of Industrial Engineering  
Chamorro, Antonio; University of Extremadura, Faculty of Economics and Business Management  
Miranda, Francisco; University of Extremadura, Faculty of Economics and Business Management |
| Keywords: | REVERSE LOGISTICS, SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT |
| Keywords (user): | Product Recovery, Closed-Loop Supply Chains |

or

Peer Review
CHARACTERISTICS OF THE RESEARCH ON
REVERSE LOGISTICS (1995-2005)

Sergio Rubio.¹

University of Extremadura. School of Industrial Engineering
Avenida de Elvas s/n. 06071. Badajoz (Spain).
Tel: +34924289600. Fax: +34924289601
E-mail: srubio@unex.es

Antonio Chamorro.

University of Extremadura. Faculty of Economics and Business Management
Avenida de Elvas s/n. 06071. Badajoz (Spain).
Tel: +34924289300. Fax: +34924272509
E-mail: chamorro@unex.es

Francisco J. Miranda.

University of Extremadura. Faculty of Economics and Business Management
Avenida de Elvas s/n. 06071. Badajoz (Spain).
Tel: +34924289300. Fax: +34924272509
E-mail: fmiranda@unex.es

¹ Corresponding author
CHARACTERISTICS OF THE RESEARCH ON
REVERSE LOGISTICS (1995-2005)

ABSTRACT
This paper aims to describe and analyse the main characteristics of articles on reverse logistics published in the production and operations management field, in order to determine the evolution of this current of research over recent years and improve our understanding of this issue. We built up a database with the articles on reverse logistics published in the most relevant journals within the period 1995-2005, and we have explored the topic, the methodology and the techniques of analysis, as well as other relevant aspects of the research. We have evaluated the first decade of research on reverse logistics, observing what has been done and how, where and by whom it has been carried out. The result is an extensive review of the research works that have created and developed the reverse logistics concept, outlining some directions of research for the near future and offering practical help to those who begin to research on this topic.

Keywords: Reverse logistics; product recovery; literature review.
1. INTRODUCTION

Reverse logistics is a research area that has been of particular interest to the academic community in recent years and this is reflected in the main journals on production and operations management. In view of this interest, we propose to analyse the main characteristics of these studies in order to evaluate what has been done and how, where and by whom it has been carried out. The answers to these questions will not only allow us to deepen our knowledge of the current situation of reverse logistics research, but will also help us to determine what still needs to be investigated, outlining some directions of research for the near future and offering practical help to those who begin to research on this topic. In this respect, the objective of this work is to analyse the main characteristics of a series of studies on the concept of reverse logistics that have been published in some of the most prestigious scientific journals in the period 1995-2005.

Clearly, the idea of tackling a literature analysis of this size is very ambitious and it must be appropriately delimited, so that the abundance and heterogeneity of the data available does not prevent us achieving the objectives we have set ourselves. In this respect, we should point out that we are only interested in those articles that can be considered essential points of reference in the reverse logistics field and we have therefore selected those papers published in the main international scientific journals.

The concept of reverse logistics has evolved over the years, passing through varying stages until becoming consolidated (de Brito and Dekker 2004, Fernández 2005). Among the many definitions that have been suggested for this concept (Stock 1992, Rogers and
Tibben-Lembke 1999, Dowlatshahi 2000, among others), the proposal of the European Working Group on Reverse Logistics, REVLOG, appears to us to be the most complete and will hence be the definition that we shall use in this current work. This research group defines reverse logistics as ‘the process of planning, implementing and controlling backward flows of raw materials, in process inventory, packaging and finished goods, from a manufacturing, distribution or use point, to a point of recovery or point of proper disposal’ (de Brito and Dekker 2004, p.5). Given its novelty as a research area, the definition of reverse logistics may cause certain confusion among those interested in the area, with the result that it can often be confused with issues that are related to it but strictly distinct from it: industrial ecology, green supply chains, waste management, etc. To avoid any possibility of ambiguity in the delimitation of the object of our work, we shall focus on those articles that have contributed to building and developing this line of research, ignoring those that do not explicitly examine any of the elements making up the concept of reverse logistics as defined here.

Furthermore, we feel that it is necessary to analyse works of the highest quality, so that our findings lead to conclusions based on criteria of quality in the research. Thus, we have selected a group of journals of renowned prestige among the international academic community, completing the selection with other publications that are highly regarded in the area of production and operations management.

Given these premises, the rest of this paper is structured as follows: first, we describe the methodology we have employed to build the database of articles to be analysed. We then present the main research topics within the reverse logistics field
identified in our analysis of the specialized literature. In the following section we outline the main findings of our research. We end with a section outlining our conclusions and final reflections.

2. METHODOLOGY

The sources of information required for the present research consist of a group of specialized journals considered likely to include works in the reverse logistics field. We have excluded proceedings and doctoral theses, in the understanding that quality studies tend to be published in this type of journal eventually and in addition these publications are the most cited in scientific papers. In this point we coincide with the majority of previous studies carried out at the international level (Stahl et al. 1988; Bairam 1994).

The next step was to select the scientific journals that would be considered in this study. We opted to select the most prestigious publications in the area of Business Management and for this we made use of the list of journals published by *ISI Journal of Citation Reports* (2004). Among the various topics used by this classification, we chose the subject categories ‘Business’, ‘Management’ and ‘Operations Research and Management Science’, which we felt would be the most likely to include journals publishing works on the concept of reverse logistics. Obviously, not all articles on reverse logistics published during the period of analysis would have been published in impact factor journals. There are other prestigious scientific publications not included in the *ISI Journal of Citation Reports* that have published articles on this topic and we feel they should be included in our work in order to lend more significance to the findings that we obtain and also to be able to
more accurately observe the evolution in the research on reverse logistics in the past decade. On the other hand, these journals are included in other studies analyzing the state of the research in the field of production and operations management (Babbar and Prasad 1998; Barman et al. 2001; Prasad et al. 2001).

For the present study, we ignore brief notes, introductions, editorials, professional commentaries and book reviews, which are common in the journals analysed and which cannot be classified as published articles. We have however opted to include articles appearing in monographic editions on Supply Chain Management and the Environment, since although these may distort the results somewhat because of their focus on a specific subject, we believe they reflect the interest of researchers on the topic that is object of study here, as well as the need to advance understanding in it.

Our analysis relates to the period 1995-2005, since although there are articles centring on this issue prior to 1995 (among which, Guiltinan and Nwokoye 1975, Fuller 1978, Ginter and Starling 1978), and even two monographs (Stock 1992, Kopicki et al. 1993), it is really only after this year that the concept of reverse logistics itself becomes consolidated and we start to see works on the environmental aspects of Supply Chain Management finding space in this type of journal (Alfaro et al. 2003). Moreover, to the best of our knowledge, there are not articles on reverse logistics published in journals included in JCR, before this year.

As we pointed out earlier, our idea was to analyse those articles that study aspects directly related to reverse logistics. With this in mind, we carried out a literature search
using the terms ‘reverse logistics’ and/or ‘product recovery’ in the title, abstract or keywords of the articles appearing in the selected journals during the period of analysis.

The inclusion of the term ‘product recovery’ is justified because in a first search where we included only the concept ‘reverse logistics’, we found that an important number of works were absent, works that were relevant in spite of not containing the term ‘reverse logistics’. This term has become consolidated only gradually, in parallel with the growing appearance of research papers on the topic in these journals. In any case, each work resulting from the search was then carefully analysed in order to confirm that its focus was indeed on reverse logistics. Furthermore, we examined the bibliography of each article to detect potential omissions from the initial search and finally we compared the resulting database with the set of bibliographical references used in various monographs (Fleischmann 2001, Dekker et al. 2004, Dyckhoff et al. 2004). Thus, we completed our database, which contained a total of 186 articles published in 26 journals (see Table 1). A total of 68.28% of the articles were published in journals edited in Europe and the remaining 31.72% in publications from the United States. However, half of the journals included in this study have been edited in USA and the other half in Europe.

Once we had built up our database we analysed each article using a data collection sheet in which we included, among other things, information concerning the research topic in which the article was framed, the methodology followed, the techniques of analysis employed, the number of authors, their origin and the number of references used. Moreover, in cases where it was relevant, we examined, complementary aspects of the
research such as the information collection techniques, sources of information employed, the temporal and geographical scope of the study and the unit of analysis utilized.

**Table 1. List of journals**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Articles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>California Management Review</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computers &amp; Industrial Engineering</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computers &amp; Operations Research</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European Journal of Operational Research</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harvard Business Review</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IEEE Transactions on Engineering Management</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IIE Transactions</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial Marketing Management</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interfaces</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Journal of Physical Distribution &amp; Logistics Management</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Journal of Production Economics</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Journal of Production Research</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Journal of Technology Management</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Operations Management</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Retailing</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of the Operational Research Society</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management Science</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Naval Research Logistics</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Omega</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operations Research</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OR Spectrum</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Production and Operations Management</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Production Planning &amp; Control</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technological Forecasting and Social Change</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Quality Management &amp; Business Excellence</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation Research Part E: Logistics and Transportation Review</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>186</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In order to determine the main research topics in the reverse logistics field, we considered it advisable to use the classification employed by Dekker et al. (2004), who identify three fundamental areas of research on reverse logistics:

1) Management of the recovery and distribution of end-of-life products

2) Production planning and inventory management

3) Supply chain management issues in reverse logistics

Within the first research topic, ‘management of the recovery and distribution of end-of-life products’, we find all those works analysing the different physical flows present in the reverse logistics systems, especially those issues relating to the collection and distribution of end-of-life (EOL) products. Thus, aspects such as the analysis of EOL product returns, the design of the reverse logistics network and its interaction with the forward logistics flow, the analysis of transport routes or questions of internal logistics, among others, are covered by this research topic. The topic ‘production planning and inventory management’ embraces those works in which the main object of the research is the coordination of the processes of EOL product recovery and particularly aspects deriving from the existence of a reverse flow of EOL products and its interaction with traditional production planning. Among the main questions analysed by the studies in this topic, we find: the effects that the existence of a reverse flow of EOL products generates in the traditional models of inventory management, the dynamic capabilities of these reverse
flows, specific aspects of planning production such as the design of disassembly operations and the coordination of manufacturing operations with economic recovery operations (remanufacturing, recycling, reuse). Finally, the topic ‘supply chain management issues in reverse logistics’ concerns those works that analyse the strategic decisions, which the existence of a reverse flow of EOL products generates in the management of the supply chain. Thus, questions such as the long-term behaviour of closed-loop supply chains, the role of IT, the impact of environmental regulation and the environmental management of reverse logistics, among others, are included in this topic.

We classified the articles within each research topic by examining the title, abstract, keywords and main body of the paper. This review was carried out independently by each member of the research team. Most of the articles were classified unequivocally into one of the three different topics. However 14.75% of them were either considered doubtful or two or more members of the team disagreed in their classifications. In these cases, we reviewed the articles again and then the team as a whole agreed on the most appropriate classification.

3. RESULTS

In the first place, we observe that reverse logistics, as a research area in the field of production and operations management, has experienced increasing interest in the period of analysis considered, a fact that is mainly reflected in the growth in the number of articles published in the journals analysed (figure 1).
One of the reasons for this spectacular growth is found in the monographs and special issues that various journals have dedicated to environmental questions associated with production and operations management. In fact, in 1999 Computers & Industrial Engineering dedicated an edition to the analysis of manufacturing processes that were respectful to the environment (Environmentally Conscious Manufacturing); in the year 2000, Interfaces published a monograph under the title ‘Sustainable Business’; in 2001, OR Spectrum and Production and Operations Management published issues on ‘Operational Research and Environmental Management’ and ‘Environmental Management and Operations’, respectively; in late 2003, Interfaces published another special edition, on this occasion on the problems thrown up by closed-loop supply chains. Finally, in 2004, California Management Review edited a special issue on ‘Closed-loop Supply Chains Management’. Throughout 2006 more special issues on reverse logistics will be published: Omega on ‘Reverse production systems’, International Journal of Production Economics on ‘Sustainable supply chain management’, OR Spectrum on ‘Product recovery’ and Production and Operations Management on ‘Closed-loop supply chains’. In addition to these special editions, in recent years various monographs on reverse logistics have been published: Stock (1998), Fleischmann (2001), Guide and Van Wassenhove (2003), Dekker et al. (2004) and Dyckhoff et al. (2004). Thus, we can clearly say that the interest of the academic community in this research topic has grown significantly in recent years, which has consequently contributed to its development, both quantitatively and qualitatively.
Analysing the articles by research topic, we observe that 56.45% can be included within the topic ‘production planning and inventory management’, 31.18% analyse questions of a strategic nature and can be framed within the topic ‘supply chain management issues in reverse logistics’, while 12.37% of the articles analyse questions relating to the ‘management of the recovery and distribution of end-of-life products’. However, we note that the topic ‘supply chain management issues in reverse logistics’ has attracted the attention of researchers in recent years. In fact, most of the works published in 2004 and 2005 fall within that research topic (figure 2).
The studies published during the period of analysis appear to be focusing on the analysis of tactical and operational decisions, a finding which should have some relation with the type of study carried out as well as the methodology followed. In this respect, the analysed works employ methodologies (figure 3) that are both quantitative (basically using mathematical models) and qualitative (case study, literature review or theoretical developments). A total of 19.89% of the articles analysed use two different research methodologies, with case studies being the most popular of the second methodologies chosen (54.05%).
With regards to the relation between the research topic and the journal in which the article appears (table 3), we find that 60.87% of the articles analysing the ‘management of the recovery and distribution of end-of-life products’ are concentrated in just four journals: Computers & Industrial Engineering, Interfaces, International Journal of Production Research and OR Spectrum. Furthermore, all of the articles on this topic are published in just ten of the analysed journals. In turn, the works on ‘production planning and inventory management’ are published in a wider spread of journals. Indeed we find only seven publications that have not published articles on this research topic in the period of analysis. In any case, the European journals European Journal of Operational Research, International Journal of Production Economics and International Journal of Production Research published fully 57.14% of the articles on this topic. With regards to ‘supply chain management issues in reverse logistics’, we find that twenty of the analysed journals
include works on this topic, with a similar level of concentration, since 67.24% of the works were published in a group of seven journals: *California Management Review, European Journal of Operational Research, Interfaces, International Journal of Physical Distribution & Logistics Management, International Journal of Production Economic, European Journal of Production Research* and Transportation Research, Part E.

Table 3. Journal and Research Topic

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>JOURNAL</th>
<th>Management of the recovery and distribution of EOL products</th>
<th>Production planning and inventory management</th>
<th>Supply chain management issues in reverse logistics</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CALIF MANAGE REV</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>17.24%</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMPUT IND ENG</td>
<td>13.04%</td>
<td>3.81%</td>
<td>2.35%</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMPUT OPER RES</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.95%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EUR J OPER RES</td>
<td>8.70%</td>
<td>17.19%</td>
<td>8.62%</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HARVARDBUS REV</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>2.35%</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IEEE T ENG MANAGE</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.95%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IE TRANS</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>4.76%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IND MARKET MANAG</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>3.45%</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTERFACES</td>
<td>17.39%</td>
<td>1.90%</td>
<td>8.62%</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IJPDA&amp;LM</td>
<td>8.70%</td>
<td>0.95%</td>
<td>12.07%</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INT J PROD ECON</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>23.81%</td>
<td>6.90%</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INT J PROD RES</td>
<td>13.04%</td>
<td>17.14%</td>
<td>6.90%</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INT J TECHNOL MANAGE</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>1.72%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J OPER MANAG</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>3.81%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J RETAILING</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>1.72%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J OPER RES SOC</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>5.71%</td>
<td>3.45%</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MANAGE SCI</td>
<td>4.35%</td>
<td>4.76%</td>
<td>1.72%</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAV RES LOG</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>1.90%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OMEGA-INT J MANAGE S</td>
<td>4.35%</td>
<td>0.95%</td>
<td>1.72%</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OPER RES</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.95%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OR SPECTRUM</td>
<td>17.39%</td>
<td>5.71%</td>
<td>1.72%</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROD OPER MANAG</td>
<td>8.70%</td>
<td>2.86%</td>
<td>3.45%</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROD PLAN CONTROL</td>
<td>4.35%</td>
<td>1.90%</td>
<td>3.45%</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TECHNOL FORECAST SOC</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>1.72%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL QUAL MANAG BUS</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>1.72%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRANSPORT RES E-LOG</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.95%</td>
<td>6.90%</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>12.37%</td>
<td>56.45%</td>
<td>31.18%</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/tprs Email: ijpr@lboro.ac.uk
Table 4. Articles by topic and methodology

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CASE STUDY</th>
<th>LITERATURE REVIEW</th>
<th>MATHEMATICAL MODEL</th>
<th>SURVEY</th>
<th>WHOLLY THEORETICAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MANAGEMENT OF THE RECOVERY AND DISTRIBUTION OF EOL PRODUCTS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>de Brito &amp; Dekker, 2003</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRODUCTION PLANNING AND INVENTORY MANAGEMENT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guide Jr. et al., 2003</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kekre et al., 2003</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linton &amp; Johnson, 2000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spengler et al., 1997</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT ISSUES IN REVERSE LOGISTICS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ansari et al., 2005</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barros et al., 1998</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buongiorno &amp; Potts, 2000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D Mining &amp; Potts, 2000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ehrhardt et al., 2001</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goggin et al., 2000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hicks et al., 2004</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johnson, 1998</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As far as the methodology employed in the articles is concerned, we grouped the articles by research topic and examined the main methodology in order to determine if there were correspondences between the topic and the methodology (table 5). From our findings, we observe a clear association between the topic ‘production planning and inventory management’ and mathematical modelling as a methodology of analysis (fundamentally operational research and control theory techniques). The works on ‘supply chain management issues in reverse logistics’, in coherence with its strategic focus, tend to employ qualitative methodologies such as the case study, conceptual descriptions and the literature review. However, at the same time as this topic expands, it can be seen that there has been a trend to use mathematical models in recent years. For its part, ‘management of the recovery and distribution of end-of-life products’ is in an intermediate position between the quantitative and qualitative methodologies, which could point to a more homogeneous development of this research topic, insofar as it analyses the strategic aspects by means of qualitative methodologies (56.52%) and the tactical and operational decisions utilizing quantitative techniques and methods.

Table 5. Research topic and Methodology

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>METHODOLOGY</th>
<th>CASE STUDY</th>
<th>LITERATURE REVIEW</th>
<th>MATHEMATICAL MODEL</th>
<th>SURVEY</th>
<th>WHOLLY THEORETICAL</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MANAGEMENT OF THE RECOVERY AND DISTRIBUTION OF EOL PRODUCTS</td>
<td>52.17%</td>
<td>4.35%</td>
<td>39.13%</td>
<td>4.35%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>12.37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRODUCTION PLANNING AND INVENTORY MANAGEMENT</td>
<td>6.67%</td>
<td>0.95%</td>
<td>92.38%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>56.45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT ISSUES IN REVERSE LOGISTICS</td>
<td>36.21%</td>
<td>6.90%</td>
<td>25.86%</td>
<td>13.79%</td>
<td>17.24%</td>
<td>31.18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>21.51%</td>
<td>3.23%</td>
<td>65.05%</td>
<td>4.84%</td>
<td>5.38%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
When studying the main techniques employed for the data analysis (table 6), we find that mathematical programming techniques are the most used in the group of articles as a whole (18.58%), these mainly been used for the analysis of the problems arising in the ‘management of the recovery and distribution of end-of-life products’. We should bear in mind that this topic includes problems of allocation and localization – traditionally formulated and solved using linear programming. For their part, the works dealing with ‘supply chain management issues in reverse logistics’ prefer to employ descriptive analysis and the case study, in coherence with the qualitative methodology that predominates in these studies. Finally, we observe that simulation, together with mathematical programming, optimization and queueing, are the most common analytical techniques within the topic ‘production planning and inventory management’, as would be expected in these works that analyse the effect that the reverse flow of EOL products has on models of inventory management.

Table 6. Techniques employed for the data analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RESEARCH TOPIC</th>
<th>Case Analysis</th>
<th>Control Theory</th>
<th>Descriptive Analysis</th>
<th>Mathematical Programming</th>
<th>Optimization</th>
<th>Queueing and Markov Process</th>
<th>Simulation</th>
<th>Others</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Management of the recovery and distribution of EOL products</td>
<td>30.43%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>8.70%</td>
<td>43.48%</td>
<td>4.35%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>4.35%</td>
<td>8.70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product planning and inventory management</td>
<td>4.76%</td>
<td>9.52%</td>
<td>1.90%</td>
<td>16.19%</td>
<td>16.19%</td>
<td>16.19%</td>
<td>20.95%</td>
<td>14.29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supply chain management issues in Reverse Logistics</td>
<td>27.59%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>29.31%</td>
<td>12.07%</td>
<td>3.45%</td>
<td>1.72%</td>
<td>6.90%</td>
<td>18.97%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>15.30%</td>
<td>5.46%</td>
<td>11.48%</td>
<td>18.58%</td>
<td>10.93%</td>
<td>9.84%</td>
<td>14.75%</td>
<td>13.66%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As far as the number of authors of each article is concerned, we observe that collaboration between researchers is predominant, since 83.87% of the works have two or more authors: specifically, 37.10% of the articles are signed by two, 35.48% by three and 11.29% by four or more authors.

With regards to the origin of the publications analysed, these are mostly concentrated in just three countries: USA (31.72%), the Netherlands (16.67%) and Germany (11.29%). In addition, 22.58% of the works have authors of different origins, although in 64.29% of these cases the first signer belongs to a research centre located in one of the three above-mentioned countries. Thus, we can say that research on reverse logistics is concentrated in research centres of these countries, or at least we observe a clear influence of them in work on this topic.

We find that 93.7% of the works are authored by members of the academic community, while the remaining 4.3% have authors who are professionals in the business or industrial world. However, these works are fundamentally collaborations between firms and the university, and only two of the articles analysed (Maslennikova and Foley 2000, Fassoula 2005) are authored exclusively by researchers with no links to a university. With respect to the articles with university origins, we find that the Erasmus University Rotterdam (the Netherlands) is the main focus of research, since 15.59% of the analysed articles have a member of this university as first signer. In fact we find 57 instances of authors connected to this university in the total number of articles selected. At a significant distance comes the Duquesne University (USA), Air Force Institute of Technology (USA) and Otto-von-Guericke University (Germany), each of which has 3.76% of the first signers.
Finally, we should point out that the Erasmus University Rotterdam is the main research centre in the reverse logistics field also from the point of view of the three research topics analysed, since scholars connected to this university first-signed 26.09% of the articles on ‘management of the recovery and distribution of end-of-life products’, 17.14% of the works analysing ‘production planning and inventory management’ and 8.62% of the articles on ‘supply chain management issues in reverse logistics’.

4. CONCLUSIONS

Throughout this work, we have analysed the development of research on reverse logistics over the recent years, by examining the scientific articles appearing in the main international specialized journals in the field of production and operations management. Our main goal has been to analyse the evolution and basic characteristics of the research on this topic, so that we could observe the path followed up to the present time, describe the current situation of the research and provide ideas about where it could be directed in the future. In accordance with our findings, we can point out the following conclusions:

- Although there were some earlier works focusing on issues related to reverse logistics, this current of research is very recent – its origins can effectively be dated to 1995. Since then, researchers have become increasingly interested in the field, as demonstrated by the progressive growth in the number of articles on the topic published (especially from 2000) and the appearance of numerous monographs in the journals. In general terms, the data on the number of publications confirms the growing interest of both the academic and professional communities in the relations

- The majority of articles centre on the study of tactical and operational aspects like production planning and inventory management, deriving from the implementation of a reverse logistics system. However, we observe that issues regarding closed-loop supply chain management have received the preferred attention of researchers in recent years, although we consider that more research on strategic factors (marketing, competition, technology) seems necessary in order to develop a theoretical framework for research.

- In our analysis of the association between topic and the methodology and research techniques used, we find a ‘typical profile’ for articles and research topic. Research on ‘management of the recovery and distribution of end-of-life products’ is characterized by using indistinctively both quantitative and qualitative techniques, applying mathematical models and the case study as main methodologies. Research on ‘production planning and inventory management’, in accord with its quantitative profile, tends to be analytical in content and favours techniques such as simulation, optimization and mathematical programming. Regarding research on ‘supply chain management issues in reverse logistics’, this was characterized by being mainly theoretical and qualitative, largely using the case study, although a quantitative trend has been detected in recent years.

- Research on reverse logistics has been led by scholars from the Netherlands, Germany and the USA. The first two of these countries have a strong environmental
tradition, both in legislative terms and with respect to the concerns of their societies, while the US is characterized by its liberal returns policy. Both features have provided an incentive for the research on reverse logistics, thereby contributing to its development. Nevertheless, it would be necessary to expand the research to the supply chains of others countries, especially the emerging and transition economies which will play a leading role in the global supply chain in the next years.

To conclude, we should stress again that our initial intention was to analyse the main characteristics of the research in the reverse logistics field, an ambitious task interacting with many other fields of research within business management, engineering and the environmental sciences. The problems have extensive ramifications; there are various ways of approaching them and many aspects to clarify. All of these will have to be analysed in future works. In this respect, we feel that research on reverse logistics should now be directed at analysing strategic aspects and developing organizational theories, allowing us to establish an appropriate framework of reference within which the tactical and operational aspects that have been analysed in recent years can be developed efficiently.
REFERENCES

Aksoy, H. K. And Gupta, S. M., Buffer allocation plan for a remanufacturing cell. 


Fleischmann, M., Inderfurth K. and Van Wassenhove, L. N., 2004, 3-27. (Springer-Verlag, Germany)


Dyckhoff, H., Lackes R. and Reese, J. (Eds.), *Supply chain management and reverse logistics*. 2004. (Springer-Verlag, Germany)


Fleischmann, M. and Kuik, R., On optimal inventory control with independent stochastic

Fleischmann, M., Beullens, P., Bloemhof-Ruwaard, J. M. and Van Wassenhove, L. N., The
156-173.

Fleischmann, M., Bloemhof-Ruwaard, J. M., Dekker, R., Van der Laan, E. A., Van Nunen, 
J. A. E. E. and Van Wassenhove, L. N., Quantitative models for reverse logistics: a 

Fleischmann, M., Krikke, H. R., Dekker, R. and Flapper, S. P. D, A characterisation of 

Fleischmann, M., Kuik, R. and Dekker, R., Controlling inventories with stochastic item 

Fleischmann, M., *Quantitative models for reverse logistics*. 2001. (Springer-Verlag, 
Germany)

Fleischmann, M., Van Nunen, J. A. E. E. and Gräve, B., Integrating closed-loop supply 
chains and spare-parts management at IBM. *Interfaces*, 2003, **33**, 44-56.

Freire, F., Thore, S. and Ferrao, P., Life cycle activity analysis: logistics and environmental 

Fuller, D.A., Recycling consumer solid waste: a commentary on selected channel 

Georgiadis, P. and Vlachos, D., The effect of environmental parameters on product 


Kiesmüller, G. P. and Minner, S., Simple expressions for finding recovery systems
Kiesmüller, G. P. and Van der Laan, E., An inventory model with dependent product
Kiesmüller, G. P., A new approach for controlling a hybrid stochastic
manufacturing/remanufacturing system with inventories and different lead-times.
Kiesmüller, G. P., and Scheder, C. W., Computational issues in a stochastic finite horizon
Kiesmüller, G. P., Optimal control of a one product recovery system with lead-times. Int. J.
Interfaces, 2000, 30, 156-165.
Kleber, R., Minner, S. and Kiesmüller, G. P., A continuous time inventory model for a
product recovery system with multiple options. Int. J. Prod. Econ., 2002, 79, 121-
141.
Kleindorfer, P. R., Sighal, K. and Van Wassenhove, L. N., Sustainable operations
Kleineidam, U., Lambert, A. J. D., Blansjaar, J., Kok, J. J. and Van Heijningen, R. J. J.,
Optimising product recycling chains by control theory. Int. J. Prod. Econ., 2000,
66, 185-195.


Mangun, D. and Thurston, D. L., Incorporating component reuse, remanufacture and
490.

Maslennikova, I. and Foley, D., Xerox’s approach to sustainability. *Interfaces*, 2000, 30,
226-233.

Matthews, H. S., Thinking outside ‘the box’: designing a packaging take-back system.

Minner, S. and Kleber, R., Optimal control of production and remanufacturing in a simple


Mostard, J. and Teunter, R., The newsboy problem with resalable returns: A single period

Mukhopadhyay, S. K. and Setoputro, R., Optimal return policy and modular design for

Nagel, C. and Meyer P., Caught between ecology and economy: end-of-life aspects of
781-792.

Nagurney, A. and Toyasaki, F., Reverse supply chain management and electronic waste

Nakashima, K., Arimitsu, H., Nose, T. and Kuriyama, S., Analysis of a product recovery


Stock, J. R., *Development and implementation of reverse logistics programs*, 1998, (Council of Logistics Management, Oak Brook, IL)


Teunter, R. H. and Vlachos, D., On the necessity of a disposal option for returned items that can be remanufactured. *Int. J. Prod. Econ.*, 2002, **75**, 257-266.


Teunter, R. H., Economic ordering quantities for recoverable item inventory systems. *Naval Research Logistics*, 2001b, **48**, 484-495.


